

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

President of Council Vanover called Council to order on December 18, 2019.

The governmental body and those in attendance recited the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mrs. McNear provided the Invocation.

Mrs. McNear tool roll call. Council members Anderson, Emerson, Ghantous, Hawkins, Ramirez, Sullivan-Wisecup and Vanover were present.

The minutes of the December 1, 2019 meeting were considered. Mr. Hawkins made a motion to accept the minutes; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded. The minutes of the December 1, 2019 meeting were approved with seven affirmative votes. The minutes of the December 4, 2019 meeting were considered. Mrs. Ghantous made a motion to accept the minutes; Mrs. Emerson seconded. The minutes of the December 4, 2019 meeting were approved with seven affirmative votes.

Committee and Official Reports

Civil Service Commission

Mrs. Zimmerlin: There have been conditional offers given to Property Maintenance and Zoning Inspector and a Maintenance Worker in the Public Works Department and both positions are slated to start tentatively in January. The Commission conducted the first of two entry exams for the patrol officer hiring process with the second exam scheduled for this Saturday at 9:00 a.m. That concludes the report.

Rules and Law

Mrs. Emerson -

No report

Finance Committee

Mr. Hawkins: Finance Committee met on December 5th of 2019 and December 18th of 2019. All members were present and we reviewed the 2020 Budget. All of you have had the opportunity now to have had the proposed 2020 Budget for some time now. The Finance Committee, through its reviewing of it does recommend approval of the 2020 Budget as you have it, we will go into that in detail with the Budget Presentation later. That concludes my report unless there is anything Mr. Ramirez has or there are any questions.

Mr. Ramirez: I agree.

Planning Commission

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Planning Commission met in these chambers on December 10th. All seven people were in. I swore in Steve Galster and Bob Diehl to being new Planning Commission members or returning Planning Commission members. We voted Don Darby the Chairman again, Dave Okum the Vice Chairman again, and Steve Galster is our new Secretary. Those were all 7-0 votes. We appointed Tom Hall as our liaison to the Board of Zoning Appeals with a 7-0 vote. Then, the Springdale Commerce Park; Buildings Two and Three for a Revised Development Plan at 12110 Princeton Pike, the old GE Park. They asked for a continuance. They had gotten a continuance the month before and we told them that we wanted them to come back with the correct lighting plan. They did not have everything that we wanted, so they asked that we continue that until the February meeting so that would give them enough time to get all of the information that they need. The drawings; the everything. So we agreed to that 7-0. We also had the Zoning Code Text Amendments after a whole lot of discussion. A whole lot of discussion and a lot of clarification. We did agree on the new Zoning Code Text Amendments and they will be coming before you, I believe, next month. Is that correct? (Addressing Mrs. Zimmerlin).

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Yes. Administration is going to request that we do the first reading on the 8th, and then the Public Hearing and second reading on the 15th (of January).

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: That did pass with a 7-0 vote. We had discussions about the BP sign and talked about where they are on that right now. I know a lot of people have asked about that. They have been told that they have a time limit on it. If it's not fixed by February, then it has to be removed or fixed. It's one of those things where it has to be fixed or we're going to fix

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup (continued): it and charge them and remove their junk, like the broken parts. That is all that I have unless Mr. Ramirez has anything else.

Mr. Ramirez: No, I agree with the report.

Board of Zoning Appeals

Mrs. Ghantous: Board of Zoning Appeals met yesterday evening, December 17th. The first item on our agenda was swearing in the two members and that was Mr. David Gleaves and Mrs. Michelle Miller. We had the election of our officers. The Chair of the Board of Zoning Appeals will be Jeffrey Anderson, the Vice-Chair, Dave Nienaber, and Secretary will be Tom Hall. We approved the minutes unanimously. There were no applications, so it was a very quick meeting and we adjourned very shortly thereafter with a little bit of discussion. Anything to add Jeff (addressing Mr. Anderson).

Mr. Anderson: The only thing I would add is, I know we didn't get into it as much last night. With the departing members, we didn't have a chance to thank them and I know at least one of them is here tonight and I wanted to do that since she wasn't able to be here. I know Ms. Daniels served as Secretary on Board of Zoning Appeals for a number of years and I think was on the board for eight years in total and that was in addition to prior service. At least for me, I appreciate the time that that takes and we didn't have a chance to do that last night, so I wanted to do that now while she was here, so, thank you for that time.

Mrs. Ghantous: Yes, me too. Thank you for bringing that up. Thank you Carmen (Daniels) for your service.

Mr. Ramirez: I'd like to thank Carmen as well. She was the Secretary for me when I was Chairman of that Board. Thank you Carmen.

Board of Health

Mrs. Emerson: Board of Health met on December 12th. We passed three regulations. Regulation R1-2019. It was the third reading and that was for license fees for food facilities in Springdale and that passed. Regulation R2-2019 was for license fees for swimming pools and spas. That also passed. Regulation R3-2019 was for license fees for hotels and motels. That also passed. We had a Resolution R2-2019 which was a proposed policy for the scheduling of Vaccine for Children (VFC) clinics at the Springdale Health Department. What that's all about is the State gives the Springdale Health Department vaccinations for us to give to the kids and it's a very tightly regulated program and what we were finding was that the clinics that we were running, a lot of the other school districts, let's say Winton Woods and stuff, those children were coming to the (Springdale) Health Department to get their vaccinations. It was making very limited amount of time for the Princeton City Schools to get in and get those vaccinations. So, this resolution basically stated how we were going to schedule those clinics. Like, if we had three clinics in a month, two of the clinics would be open just to Princeton school district children and then residents who also needed vaccinations. Then, one during that month would be an open clinic that other school districts and stuff could come in and also get vaccinations for schools. That also passed. The Public Health Accreditation (PHAB) is moving right along. We've turned in the documents for that and we now have a site visit for May 14th and May 15th. There will be three site reviewers here looking through the paperwork and checking out the Health Department. So, we look forward to hearing that and that being passed. Springdale Hotel Motel Program; the hotel inspections have been completed; the first round. Those hotels and motels were given things that they needed to work on and improve. The follow-up inspections will be at the very end of this month and then the first of January. There will be pre-administrative hearings if dictated by inadequate regulatory compliance. The next Produce Pop Up is scheduled for January 24th and that is a Friday, from 9:30 to 10:30 and it will be at the Heritage Hill Elementary School cafeteria. For the Nurse's Report; we had zero Narcan for November. We were also given the November drug overdose and death and those are continuing to decline. There is very minimal activity of flu right now. Last year, at this time, we had six hospitalizations; this year we have nine, but it's still a very minimal sporadic activity. The Children's Health Fair will have a kickoff meeting in January and they're planning on having that Children's Health Fair May 1st of 2020. The Latino Coalition of Southwest Ohio; the November meeting was cancelled and the December meeting they will be going over successes and challenges of the 2019 Latino Expo that they had. That concludes my report unless there is questions.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Shvegza (continued): in that area, both the legislation from Springdale and the legislation from Sharonville was submitted to ODOT (Ohio Department of Transportation) and they'll be in the process of making those changes official. The Stage One plan, review comments from ODOT; we've just received those yesterday, so we're looking through those at this point. That concludes my comments.

Communications

-

None

Communications from the Audience

President Vanover: May I ask that you, as the game show said, enter and sign in please and identify yourself.

Mrs. Jones: Hi. Thank you for allowing me to speak tonight. My name is Karen Jones. I live at 9 Woodside Court, which is part of the Knolls condo complex off of Glensprings. I am here today to request the removal of a tree; a pine tree, that hangs over my assigned parking spot at the Knolls. Over the years, there has been a little sap on my car from time to time. Excuse me, I don't usually do this public speaking. There's been a little sap on my car, but, this year, the sap has been ridiculous. I brought pictures. I don't know if I'm allowed to come and pass them. I have ten little sets. They're paper-clipped, so you can just pass them down. That shows the position of the tree with my parking spot with my car and then there's two pictures of that and then there are two pictures that look like a white blob. That's my car, which happens to be white, with little brown spots on it; that is the sap. So, I contacted the Knolls Management company, who, in turn, contacted the City of Springdale, requesting permission to remove the tree. But, the request was denied because the tree is not dead or dying. I spoke to Randy Campion, the Inspection Supervisor. He explained his criteria for determining whether a tree could be removed. So, I am here tonight to try to get permission from City Council to have the tree removed. It is a nuisance. My car looks bad; it needs ongoing removal of sap at this point, which, I have learned, is a labor-intensive process. And, it does, over time, cause discoloring and staining or it can cause discoloring and staining of the paint on my car. I don't believe anyone would want to have to park their car, every day, under a tree that oozes sap. So, I'm asking for you to please consider granting permission for removal of this tree. Thank you.

Mayor Webster: Did one of our inspectors tell you that you need to come before Council to get permission for the tree to come down?

Mrs. Jones: It was suggested to me that my next step, because it was denied. My understanding, because I did speak to him (Mr. Campion), was that he had to base it on the criteria, which was dead or dying and it didn't meet that criteria, and I said, "Well, what can I do next?" It was suggested that I; I don't know which one of us initiated that suggestion, so I'm not, it's been a while ago.

Mayor Webster: This tree is on the property of the Knolls condos?

Mrs. Jones: Correct.

Mayor Webster: Have you reported it to your Homeowner's Association?

Mrs. Jones: Yes.

Mayor Webster: And what did they say?

Mrs. Jones: They requested, they need permission from the City of Springdale to remove the tree. Because, it's not a single-family home; it's a condo complex. And, they now need permission, that's what I was told.

Mayor Webster: Well, you know, I live in a condominium complex and we cut trees down all the time. I mean, if they're dead and so forth.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mrs. Jones: Right, but my tree is not dead. I was told if the tree was dead or dying, I would've gotten permission, but, I was told, and I went through, first, I called the management company that runs our condo complex. She contacted the City of Springdale. The inspector came out, and he had pictures and I came and talked to him because I wanted to understand the situation. I was told in the City of Springdale that because it's a condo complex, I don't know the exact term, there's a terminology for like a business or something that we had to have permission to cut the tree down.

Mayor Webster: Okay. Let us look into it. I would think that's something we could take care of. If not, we'll bring it back to Council. But, I think we can handle it here.

Mr. Braun: I was just going to weigh in. Mrs. Zimmerlin and I were just talking. If that is part of a development plan, they may have been required to plant a certain number of trees. That may be where the City gets involved, but, what we'll commit to doing is we'll take a look at that paperwork, find out what's going on, and we'll have someone from Administration get in touch with you.

Mrs. Jones: Okay.

Mr. Braun: If you could leave your sign in information, maybe a phone number on there; that would be helpful.

Mrs. Jones: I sure will.

Mr. Braun: Thank you.

Mrs. Jones: Thank you very much.

President Vanover: Thank you.

Mrs. Emerson: Have we looked into trimming the tree? Would that help your situation at all if we trimmed it back? Or is it too far over the car that that won't work?

Mrs. Jones: I think you'd have to trim like half of it, but, I mean, I'd be okay with it. I'm no expert on trimming a tree to know what that would do to the tree. That would take a tree expert to comment. But, I know with the pictures it's kind of hard to see, but, it's almost like that whole half of the tree is now hanging.

Mrs. Emerson: Over your car. Okay. Thank you.

Mrs. Jones: But, thank you.

President Vanover: Thank you.

Mrs. Jones: Thank you.

Mrs. Daniels: Good evening everyone. My name is Carmen Daniels. I live at 12095 Chesterdale. I have a couple of issues. One, I have spoken with a couple of Council people before. My parents are here tonight and they're in their 80's. The other day I called, well my mom called me and told me these (held up a small item) things were in her driveway. They were in her driveway. I'll pass them around, and they were in her grass. I called over here and spoke to Gordon. He kind of played it like didn't really make a big deal, but I said, "My dad should not be outside picking these up." So, he (Gordon) went over there. Not only did he pick those up, he picked up big nails. They live right across the street from where all the development. I've complained before about the roads being muddy. For Thanksgiving, our family had visitors. There was horrible dust and everything in my parent's house. It's a shame that we care more about the new homes, versus the people that currently live there. There's a lady that had a broken arm and I spoke to somebody. She was out there picking up clothes food and everything and so I'm asking you to please hold these developers accountable for the work that they're doing over there because my dad should not be picking those up from his driveway, nor his grass. Because, if they get a flat tire, then we're going to have to pay for that. The City won't reimburse him for flat tires. That's one part. The other part is, I'll read my note.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mrs. Daniels (continued): *“Greetings to the Honorable Mayor Webster, and Council. Again, I state my name is Carmen Daniels. I live at 12095 Chesterdale Road in the Heritage Hill area. I have lived in the City of Springdale for over 30 years. I’ve had the pleasure of serving on a couple of the City boards; the Recreation Commission, for several terms. And, most recently, I served as the Secretary of the Zoning and Appeals Board for the last two terms. I applied for the open Council seat when it was vacated a couple of years ago. And, I followed that with a campaign run to obtain a seat on Council last year for the Heritage Hill area. I have served as a Precinct Exec in Ward E for many years and was very instrumental in getting additional seven new and season residents involved in the City of Springdale. I mention my civic involvement to emphasize my interest and commitment to serve in the City of Springdale. On November 24th, while I was attending my granddaughter’s brain tumor survivor’s camp in Indiana, I received a call from the Mayor stating that I would not be re-appointed to the BZA (Board of Zoning Appeals) for another term. He stated, ‘He was going in another direction’. I come tonight asking my elected officials what direction is the City taking us in that my commitment to serve is no longer valued and needed? I would also like to find out what other boards and commissions are open to the residents to serve on?”*

Mayor Webster: What was your last question?

Mrs. Daniels: I would like to find out what other boards and commissions are open to the residents to serve on since you didn’t re-appoint me to the BZA.

Mayor Webster: There are no other openings to my knowledge. They open up from time to time as people

Mrs. Daniels: That’s not what I asked.

Mayor Webster: That’s not correct?

Mrs. Daniels: That’s not what I asked. I asked what other boards and commissions are open. I did not say vacancies. I just asked what other ones are open to the residents to serve on and I’ll investigate the tenure for those myself.

Mayor Webster: Well, in addition to the Board of Zoning Appeals, there’s Planning Commission, there’s Charter Revision, there’s Civil Service, and there’s Park and Recreation as you well know. There’s Board of Health, Tax Review Board.

Mrs. Daniels: What was the last one?

Mayor Webster: Tax Review Board. There’s Volunteer Fireman Dependents Board. We’ve had a couple of residents. Then there’s the Housing Building and Fire Appeals Board. There’s four people on there.

Mrs. Daniels: So, if someone can, I guess my main question is since you stated that you were going in a different direction, I just wanted to know what that direction is that...

Mayor Webster: I was going in a different direction because I did not want to re-appoint you to the Board of Zoning Appeals. Okay.

Mrs. Daniels: Okay.

Mayor Webster: I tried to say it a nice way. I’m going in a different direction.

Mrs. Daniels: That’s why I’m here to ask. What is it?

Mayor Webster: I don’t think this is the proper venue to comment on that. I think that’s strictly my decision as to who I want to appoint to the Boards. This Council has nothing to say about the appointments that I made. Now, there are some that I do have to get approval on. The Board of Health they have to confirm, my Planning Commission appointments they have

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mayor Webster (continued): to confirm. All the other ones they do not have anything to say about it. It's strictly my decision.

Mrs. Daniels: But, as a resident that's trying to get more people involved, I think the residents have a right to understand what direction that the City is going in.

Mayor Webster: I agree. I want more people involved too. That's why I wanted to go in a different direction. I wanted to appoint some new people to the Board.

Mrs. Daniels: Well then, if that's your answer, then that's your answer. You just wanted to have different people involved. If that's your answer, then that's your answer.

Mayor Webster: Well, that's a different direction.

Mrs. Daniels: Okay. Hm. Thank you.

Mayor Webster: You're welcome.

Mr. Hawkins: Mrs. Daniels, I know you have been involved civically, not just in Springdale, but also with regard to some of our first interactions were with regard to you running for Princeton School Board when I ran some time ago. So, there's no question to your dedication with regard to trying to help out the City and help out the community in general. As you have heard from several Council members, they have appreciated your time on the Board of Zoning Appeals. With regard to the concerns and, we've had dialogue with regard to the Springrose development and not just your parents, but there have been several residents that have had problems, complaints, and issues with regard to noise, dirt, pollution. Even just some of the conduct of some of the workers in terms of possibly some things that were being said on site and music that was maybe questionable or inappropriate. I know a lot of those things are going through Administration. I know Administration has tried to address those things as best they can and I know there are probably several other Council members that have gotten calls regarding those things too. So, I implore you guys as well as other residents that if there are things that come up and problems that come up, please contact the elected officials, please contact Administration, because it's one of those things. Nobody's camped out there. Folks may come through there and nobody is going to know as well as the residents that are living right there abutting up to that property the day-to-day things that you guys are going to see and experience. So, it's important that you let the City know so we can try to address it as best we can. I appreciate you coming in and letting us know about the problems and I'm sorry that your parents are going through that and having to address it. But, the City Administration I'm sure will do what they can to make sure they're monitoring it, but it's important to bring it to our attention, because if we don't, it may not know about everything that happens. So, thank you.

Presentation of 2020 Budget

Mr. Hawkins: You all have before you the proposed 2020 budget. I want to first, on behalf of myself and Mr. Ramirez, thank Mr. Jones, Mrs. Zimmerlin, Mr. Williams, and a special thanks to Ms. Morgan for all the hard work and effort in putting together a very comprehensive and detailed document. As you look at this, the Administration's projections definitely which show the City's finances are making or are moving in the right direction and things are positive and look to only get more positive as this document, in terms of projected revenue doesn't even account for an entire year of benefiting from the income tax increase. Before we dive into it, Department to Department, I just want to turn it over to Administration if there is any comments that Mr. Jones or Mrs. Zimmerlin want to make before we get going.

Mr. Jones: I think the only thing that I would offer is I'm kind of glad that we're up to this point and we've kind of turned it over to our Chair now and we're ready for Council's acceptance and such. It's a pretty tedious task and for the recommendation of Mr. Williams and some Department Heads, we started this process several months ago. In fact, prior Administrations also started it several months in advance, but we decided to go even earlier. We thought it would benefit us in the long run and it did seem to help, but there are a lot of meetings, a lot of time taken and Mr. Hawkins, I appreciate your kind remarks. It's very taxing on folks, but, the good news is we get through it. We think we've put together a good, solid budget. We are extremely grateful for the residents of this community to support the tax increase. You are

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Jones (continued): correct, that is reflected in here. And, moving forward, it will benefit us in 2020, but, in 2021, Mr. Williams and Mrs. McNear will tell you that's when you'll see the full force and effect of that increase. I'll turn it over to Amanda (Zimmerlin) if she has anything to offer.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: We're ready to answer questions.

Mayor Webster: I just want to echo Mr. Hawkins comments. A lot of people contributed to this budget. It's not a one man show, but I commend John for the organization that he has shown in putting this budget together. This is two in a row that he's put together without having him or his staff having to work until 1:00 a.m. in the morning to do so and I think that's a tribute to him and his organization. He's exactly right. This thing starts down at the ground level with the Department Directors and the Assistant Directors and everything else putting input into this thing and it all bubbles up to the document that you see here tonight. But, there's an absolute ton of man hours that go into this. But, I think that this has been one of our strong points and it's helped us immensely to get through some of the financial hard times that we've had to endure over the last ten to 15 years because we do have a very strong budgeting process and we try to adhere to that as much as possible and not just the Administration, but also the City Council. Anyway, guys, thank you very much for your contribution to this very comprehensive 2020 budget. I'm sure Mr. Hawkins is going to zip right through this thing.

Mr. Hawkins: It's up to Council. We will go through as we always do; Department by Department. If folks have comments, concerns, please voice them as we get to those places.

Police Department

Mr. Anderson: I don't think this is specific to the Police Department; it's just a question I was hoping you could clarify overall as we go through the budget. Each Department, at least every year, has stated goals and objectives and many of them are very measurable. I think they're great. I love that we're able to have those kind of things as part of the budget so we can measure against them. My question is, "How often are those goals being measured and are the results of those objectives something that is publically available if somebody wanted to see how we're doing against say, one of these Police objectives where it's talking about 80% increase of such and such." Is that something, as we go through this, that the public or that we're able to review later as we check the effectiveness of "the spend" against the objectives or is that something that's done completely internally?

Mrs. Zimmerlin: We've never brought that to Council before. It's always been done internally. I'm not exactly sure what you would be looking for as if you're looking for like a specific report?. Like, you'll notice that one of these, in the Police budget is a rifle rated shield. I'm hoping that we never have to use that. I'm not sure how you want that measured; what you're looking for?

Mr. Anderson: and I appreciate that. For example, some of them might be very interesting to the public, like, for example, 80% of officers completed target and service training. How are we doing against training numbers or, in the Fire Department, how are we doing against certifications or call rates or repeats. There are certain measures that, we get a lot of questions about how we're doing against the budget. We've talked about Open Checkbook. But, this, I think, is that next level of openness. How do we measure the effect of "the spend"? So, I just didn't know if you've thought about that.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: No.

Mayor Webster: I don't think, Jeff (Anderson) that we necessarily measure it down to the line item. I think it's more, for example, let's take the Rec Center. Measure the pool; okay, we've got "x" number of dollars for pool operation and I think we don't manage how much for materials, and how much for this, and how much for that; it's more of the pool operation and how we're doing there. I think that's what we hold the Directors responsible for. In, the same way, form what you want; take the Police Department. There are certain items; jail operation for instance. That would be a line item we probably would be measuring individually. But,

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mayor Webster (continued): those no written report on that. That would be a conversation that Administration would have down with the Administration down at the Police Department. "Why are you running over budget on jail or what's the deal with ammo by \$10,000; what are you doing? Shooting up the town?" That kind of conversation. But, I don't think there's a detailed report that's generated that would go into every single line item.

Mr. Anderson: No, and I appreciate that. I wouldn't expect there to be. With the level of detail, these are great. I love how measureable many of these are. I guess I just wanted to make sure there wasn't something that was already being done. So, I guess the punchline is if there's a question that people have against the Department spend and there is an objection against it, either Council or the public could always ask for how we're doing against that and that would be the best way to get that answered.

Mayor Webster: When I first took over the Finance office, umpteen years ago, every Department had three line items. Personnel, supplies/materials, and capital improvements. That was it. And so, that has grown into this (displays 2020 Budget binder). I think, Jeff, and he's laughing back there, (laughter). He'd probably like to have that today, but, I'm sure the State Auditor probably wouldn't let us get away with that today, but, I don't think that the State Auditor would insist that we have this level of detail.

Mr. Anderson: And, I wouldn't expect that. I think, again, I'm not being critical of this, I love the way that it's broken down by Department and has measurable goals. I just wanted to make sure that people knew, and that I knew that if there's a question about it; I just felt like there might be more questions about the spend this year since we raised taxes and I think it's fair that we're able to tell the public what they've gotten for that extra money, right? It wasn't just "fill-in a gap", but, we promised additional services or better service. I think there might be cases where we can point back to these things and say, "Hey, this is where we make good on that promise." So, I was just trying to understand as we go through the budget, how tight that link is going in. So, I appreciate the answer. I've got what I need on that. Thank you.

Mr. Hawkins: I think the measurable are probably more about Department performance for the Administration to adhere to and manage than what's going to necessarily translate financially. Along those lines though, and something that we did discuss in the Finance meeting, and probably something that's helpful for Council, I thought it would be helpful from my perspective, there's a whole bunch of stuff that Finance Committee doesn't even see before it comes to Council. It gets whittled down; the Department Heads are asking, Directors are asking John and Amanda for. So, there was some discussion that it would be helpful, albeit, very efficient and we're glad we don't see how the sausage is made necessarily before it gets to us, but, when there's a Department that's been asking for something for a number of years, we may not know that they've been asking for a number of years because we don't get it until we see it in here, and maybe they've been asking, but we just haven't seen it yet. And so, when the Administration can let us know that, "Hey, this is something that they really wanted", that's also I think helpful for Council as Council goes to make decisions about these things when we see an increase or something new, that we have that perspective that someone has been requesting that. Jumping back into the Police Department. Any questions on the Police Department budget? Questions concerns? (None)

Fire Department

Mayor Webster: If I may comment on that. This does naturally include the second year of the SAFER Grant. Which, for some of you newcomers, the SAFER Grant is a federal grant we got. We added three fireman to the staff over there. What's the percentages? Do you have those off the top of your head, Amanda (Zimmerlin) or one of you?

Mr. Jones: 75% first year and then it's 75% the second year and 35% the third year.

Mayor Webster: After that, we have to pick up the tab 100%, but we get that help with the first three years for those three people. So, anyway, the second year is reflected in the budget here along with the Lieutenants, the three Lieutenants, which, hopefully, will be in place by around the first of the year.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Anderson: One question on this. This might be one of those things that the Administration has heard and then already whittled down. When my family was at the wonderful Open House the Fire Department did this past year, one of the Department members was telling myself and a couple of the other families that they're looking forward to a new ladder truck and they were "spec'ing that out as a Department and taking about that. That's not in here and I'm not sure that I've heard discussion about that. I know we just got a new pumper truck, which is fantastic, we have a ladder truck that seems great. Is that one of those things that is being pushed?

Mayor Webster: Jeff (Anderson), where we stand on that; a couple of years ago, we decided that we would replace both pumpers and then the ladder wagon. We would do them, all three of those vehicles on a three year lease; full payout lease. So, we embarked upon that path, so the first pumper, this is the third year of the first pumper. So now, we have to decide what we're going to do next. Are we going to follow our original plan and go with the second pumper or, are we going to jump ahead and do the ladder wagon? Now there's some debate going back and forth as to which way we go on that. But, that decision would be made some time this year so that we can get that plugged in and going forward. The long term plan is to replace both of those remaining vehicles.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you. I was mentally braced when I received the report to see that million dollar plus item in there because I know those aren't inexpensive. They're impressive machines. So, thank you for that. So, we'll look forward to that discussion and debate later in the year.

Mayor Webster: It will be before Capital Improvements sometime this year.

Mr. Hawkins: And to piggyback on that, we discussed the ladder truck engine replacement. It's been several years that that's something that's been discussed in Finance Committee meetings. So, it was something that was being forecasted down the road at some point in time, but, it's \$1.5 million (dollars) \$1.7 million (dollars)? So, it's huge. One other thing that we also discussed with regard to the SAFER Grant was Administration was talking about possibly putting in some, not possibly, at some point putting in some financial retention safeguards going forward so that we're not training folks and they're just leaving us, having gotten the financial benefit of all that.

Mr. Jones: Mr. Hawkins, if it's okay, I'll just add to that. That's a great point and good memory on that. Basically, what's happening to us is we may have somebody from an hour and a half away take a job here and they'll work for us, we'll send them through their basic training, we'll get them their paramedic certifications, and then, they're driving along the way, they'll make the decision and maybe they want to go back home, and live closer to where their friends and family are, so, they'll head back and we'll lose them in eight, ten months, a year; generally it's around a year mark. So, we're putting in some safeguards that basically, during the first year, if you leave, we'll prorate some financial obligations that you'd owe back to the City for some of that training and the turnout gear that we have. We spend an inordinate amount of money bringing people in. Every department costs something, but the Fire Department, in particular, you have to specifically get the turnout gear for them, and it's several thousand dollars, but, also the training. So, the idea is that if they stay one year, we'll prorate that, two years, and then if they complete a three year term with us, then we waive everything. So, the idea behind that is that they just don't come; we'd provide all the training and then they just up and leave on us. We've really gone back and forth on that, but, Amanda (Zimmerlin) and I have worked closely with the Fire (Department) and, basically, it's not that we don't want people to have the opportunity to transfer, if that's what they want, it just really puts us in a pickle, because when they're being trained, really, they're an observer to us until they get their certifications. So, it's not until they get fully trained, that we actually benefit from them. Well, if they leave at the end of the year, we basically did not receive that benefit. So, in fact, what we really do get is a lot of time and a half from the person that's doing the training, or those people that are doing the training. So, not to get too "into the weeds" on that, but, the bottom line is we think that prorating this amount will help us going forward. Thank you for allowing me that opportunity.

Mr. Hawkins: Thank you. Any other comments, questions regarding the Fire Department?

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

President Vanover: Well, you were talking about the ladder and, correct me if I'm wrong, but when we bought that, what, almost twenty years ago now, it was \$275,000?

Mayor Webster: Oh boy, I'm not sure; it's pretty old.

President Vanover: That's the cost change and that was, when we initially talked about; we did first pumper, doing the second in three years, and then the ladder; the aerial, because, of course, the hotel is gone, so we don't have that high rise, so where they're going with and that is still being added, but, cost is going to be a big drive on that. It's not cheap.

Health Department - no questions/concerns

Parks and Recreation Department

Mr. Anderson: Just a quick question; does this budget include extended hours going into next year? I had heard that that was a possibility. Is that accounted for in this budget and still part of the plan?

Mayor Webster: The swimming pool hours has been greatly enhanced in this budget. The pool will be open from noon until 8:00 p.m. seven days a week. The pool will also be open on weekends in the last couple of weekends in August. In the past, we've closed it when school started, and we didn't reopen it. We locked the joint up, if you will, when school opened. Now, going forward, we will keep it open on the weekends until Labor Day. We also will pull the concession stands operation back in-house, if you will, the budget reflects the hiring of a concession manager and I think two concession workers; part-time workers. So we will be offering, when the pool is open, the concession stand will be open.

Mr. Anderson: I think that's great. That's one of the questions I always got, aside from Sunday hours, why it was so short on the weekends, when that's when people are off and then the concession stand. I think that's one of those things we can point to and say, "Look, we're trying to help".

Mayor Webster: That's in answer to your question of, "What are people getting for the tax increase"? That's a biggie right there.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you. I'm glad we could highlight that.

Mr. Hawkins: Any other questions or comments, concerns regarding the Parks and Recreation budget? (None)

Building Department

Mr. Hawkins: You'll see in there with regard to our Administration being fiscally responsible under line 4501-52810, the repurposing of some Police vehicles.

No questions/concerns for Building Department

Public Works Department - no questions/concerns

Economic Development Department

Mayor Webster: This is one of those budgets we hope to increase this greatly.

Mr. Anderson: I'm sorry, I thought we missed the Administrative office budget. Did we skip that one or did I miss it? It was just before the Economic Development Department.

Mr. Hawkins: Yes.

Mr. Anderson: I only mention that because I have one small question on that. If I may. So, the Magistrate line item is still zeroed out. That's correct, I know, did we have a change there? I know we just did the contract. Is that still a zeroed line item for next year?

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mayor Webster: No, that's somewhere else in the budget.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: It is somewhere else in the budget.

Mr. Williams: (off mic) It's under Contractual Services, not under payroll.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Yes.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

Mayor Webster: We didn't do away with the Magistrate or with his salary.

Mr. Hawkins: Any questions with regard to the Administrative budget? Or the Economic Development Budget? (None for either).

Finance Department

Mr. Hawkins: Don't be shy that Mr. Williams is in the room. No questions or concerns? (None)

Legislative Body Budget

Mr. Anderson: Sorry, you triggered the question for Mr. Williams. I just wanted to make sure that I understand. So, we had the election the prior year. We budgeted the expense for that in 2020 because we pay that in arrears to Hamilton County, is that correct? Because it's zero expected expenditure for 2019. We budgeted \$9,000 for elections in 2020. Is that to pay for this past tax vote?

Mayor Webster: We will pay for that in the real estate settlement we get in 2020. It will reflect the cost that we incurred in 2019.

Mr. Anderson: Perfect. Yes, thank you.

Mr. Hawkins: Any other questions with regard to Legislative Budget? (None).

Other Commissions Budget

Mr. Hawkins: That's where you have the contractual services with regard to the Magistrate.

Mr. Anderson: Just one question. Is this, where would see, isn't this where we would see the where we're planning the Comprehensive Plan work? Would that show up here or is that a different line item later in the budget?

Mrs. Zimmerlin: It is here. It's in Other Contractual.

Mr. Anderson: That includes that.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Yes.

Mr. Anderson: That 116 now, that jump includes, how much of that is the . .

Mrs. Zimmerlin: \$100,000. If you look on page 64.

Mr. Anderson: I see it now.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Yes.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

President Vanover: Mrs. Zimmerlin you had . . .

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mrs. Zimmerlin: That was it.

President Vanover: That was it.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: That's where it was.

President Vanover: Okay.

Mr. Hawkins: One other question for the Administration and I may have asked this previously and just didn't make a note of it. Did we see an increase in the number of cases the Public Defender was dealing with? Just with seeing the estimated expenditures almost double. Was that based on having more cases or do we know?

Mayor Webster: We didn't adjust the rate, so that would have to be more cases.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: It is. It's more cases.

Tax Department Budget - no questions/concerns

General Administration Budget

Mr. Anderson: So the proposed budget that we're looking at here for not just this department, but other non-union, non-contracts. Does that include the proposed increase that we're considering tonight or will there be an adjustment based on the vote?

Mrs. Zimmerlin: It does include the increase. The two percent that we're requesting this evening.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

Transfers and Advances Budget - no questions/concerns

Adult Sports Fund Budget - no questions/concerns

Street Maintenance Fund Budget

Mr. Anderson: Sorry. A question on the Landan Lane Project that's listed here. I had a question on it prior to this meeting and I couldn't, for the life of me, remember what work was going on there. Could you remind me what that is?

Mr. Shvegza: Yes. Basically, that's the complete replacement of the pavement, curb, and gutter, and catch basins along that length of road.

Mr. Anderson: Okay, but it's just the roadway, it's just additional repairs, curbs and road. It's not a special property or arrangement we have over there.

Mr. Shvegza: The only other thing that approaches the property would be the replacement of the driveway aprons in through that area.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

Mayor Webster: Have you driven that Jeff (Anderson)?

Mr. Anderson: That's back off Northland (Boulevard). I have not been back there in quite some time. That's why I was trying to remember.

Mayor Webster: You should take a ride down Landan Lane.

Mr. Anderson: Should I take the motorcycle and a helmet?

Mayor Webster: Maybe you should take a walk down Landan Lane.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I will tell you about the Landan Lane. I got a phone call. Actually, when I was in the hospital having my kidney stone surgery from the people at Springdale Bindery right there and they had invited me out to actually walk the street, and it's not even fun to walk there. It's pretty torn up. I'm glad that it's getting taken care of. I appreciate it being in the budget. Thank you.

State Highway Improvement Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Grants Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Court Computerization Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Commerce Park TIF Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Drug Law Enforcement Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Law Enforcement Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
DUI Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns

Mr. Hawkins: Is there a reason why we're still calling it DUI? We haven't evolved yet.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Would you prefer it to be OVI?

Mr. Hawkins: Just trying to be consistent with our State legislators who know so much.

Law Enforcement Training Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Insurance Trust Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Health Insurance Trust Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Street Improvement Operations Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Street Improvement Debt Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Capital Improvement Funds Budget	-	no questions/concerns

Mr. Hawkins: You will see the locker room renovations in there.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: We actually had a bid opening earlier this week for that project and the bids actually came in at \$313,000. So, this evening we're going to be asking under New Business for a motion to reject those bids so we can re-bid. We only had one bidder as well.

Mayor Webster: The estimate was \$250,000.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you. I appreciate that update. Can we go back to 087 for just one question on the Street Improvement Operations Fund for the Beacon Hills Subdivision Kenn Road Rehab section? I know that there's mention in the text about the settlement from Prus Construction for the cape seal that we discussed previously. Where does that show up in the budget? Is it listed as a debt incurrence in this years for the total spend or did that get put into a different part of the General Fund? So that would show up in the actual expenditure. It shows up in the actual expenditures from this 2018 actual expenditure.

Mr. Williams: (off mic) Correct.

Mr. Anderson: It already includes that deduction.

Mr. Williams: (off mic) Yes.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Hawkins: Questions or concerns in the Capital Improvement Funds Budget?

Mr. Anderson: Going back to the locker room comment. So, how long do you expect it to be before additional bidding would happen and was the bidder that you received the bid from the same one that we got the estimate from before or was the estimate something that we did internally before it went to bid? I'm just wondering what the delay is. What we should expect the delay to start the project should be.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: We are using MSA to do this work for us, as the contract engineer and architect for this project. I plan on actually calling them tomorrow to talk to them about rebidding the project after we reject the bids this evening. The last time we bid it, I think it was out to bid for three weeks. I would assume it would go out for the same amount of time. I think part of it is probably the time of year that we're bidding it since it's right around the holidays. I don't know how many people are actually paying attention, so hopefully if we get in right at the beginning of the year, and we can get some better prospects.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

Mr. Hawkins: Any other questions or concerns with regard to Capital Improvements Fund Budget?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: The Community Center playground. What kind of improvements are we making there, just out of curiosity, or is it just the upkeep of what we have right now or are we getting something new? What was that line item?

Mrs. Zimmerlin: That is our share for the replacement of the playground. If you recall, that was one of the CDBG projects that we decided to do. This is our half.

Mr. Anderson: The Community Center roof replacement. I know I was in there when it rained last..., well I think every time it rains, I think I know. What's the timing on that or what you're expecting?

Mayor Webster: I'm not sure of the timing. I think we've got \$325,000 in the budget this year for a roof for the Community Center. Now, for the entire roof, if we did the entire structure down there, it's about \$700,000. So, the fortunate part about it is it's a flat roof and there's eight different sections. So, we could do it in eight different increments; different elevations and so on and so forth, it gets sort of complicated. Anyway, what we're going to do is do approximately half of it this year and I'm not sure exactly when we're going to bid that out, but, anyway, the money is in the budget for it and then we'll do the other half next year. We should, with the way that it is divided up into eight sections, we should be able to pick \$325,000 worth easily.

Mr. Anderson: I would encourage over the basketball courts. I know they're out there and the kids were having some trouble.

Mayor Webster: I'm sure the new gym is the top priority.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you.

Mayor Webster: We understand that, Jeff (Anderson) was sharing this with us at the last Park and Recreation Commission meeting that in the old gym that roof has been on there nine, ten, 12 years. It's still under warranty and we're not having any problems there. We probably will put that off and may not even do that one next year. If it's in good shape and if it springs a leak, it'll go against the warranty.

President Vanover: Right.

Mr. Hawkins: And the interim repairs that were done have been great. My kids are both playing and no one is having to dodge buckets this year and so it's wonderful.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Anderson: I can assure you, there have been buckets in the weight room. I'm not sure if you've seen the weight room recently or not.

Mr. Hawkins: You can look at me and see I haven't seen the weight room recently (laughter).

Mr. Jones: But as far as the basketball courts, you are correct and a credit to the staff who handled that internally and saved us literally thousands of dollars. Yes, it's not a perfect system yet, but, we're getting there.

Mr. Hawkins: Any other questions, concerns, comments on the Capital Improvements Fund? (None)

Residential Recycling Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Tri-County Mall TIF Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Parks and Urban Forestry Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Northwest Business Center TIF Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Unclaimed Money Funds Budget	-	no questions/concerns
OBBS Assessment Funds Budget	-	no questions/concerns
Fire Insurance Proceeds Fund Budget	-	no questions/concerns

Revenues

Mr. Hawkins: Any questions or concerns with regard to anything in our revenue portion of the budget? (None) Any questions or concerns with regard to the document as a whole?

Mrs. McNear: Just a comment to say that this is definitely endorsed by the Finance Department and hope that everyone else on the dais tonight will also approve it. Thank you.

Mr. Hawkins: Thank you Mr. President.

President Vanover: Alright, that will end our Presentation on the Budget.

Ordinances and Resolutions

Ordinance No. 53-2019

AMENDING ORDINANCE NO. 58-2018; AS AMENDED BY ORDINANCE NO. 31-2019 TO PROVIDE FOR WAGE INCREASES AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY

Mrs. Zimmerlin: We actually need to amend this ordinance. There is a typo that says 53-2018 and it should be 53-2019.

Mr. Hawkins: Move to amend what is currently titled as Ordinance No. 53-2018 to be title as Ordinance No. 53-2019.

Mr. Anderson: Second.

Council passed the motion to amend Ordinance 53-2018 to change the title to be Ordinance 53-2019 passes with seven affirmative votes.

Mr. Anderson made a motion to adopt Ordinance 53-2019; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup second.

Ordinance No. 53-2019 passes with seven affirmative votes.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Ordinance No. 54-2019

ADOPTING A SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATION/ESTIMATED RECEIPTS ORDINANCE TO MAKE SURE APPROPRIATIONS FOR CURRENT EXPENSES AND OTHER EXPENDITURES AND ADJUST ESTIMATED RECEIPTS FOR THE CITY OF SPRINGDALE, OHIO DURING THE FISCAL YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2019

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup made a motion to adopt Ordinance No. 54-2019; Mrs. Emerson seconded.

Ordinance No. 54-2019 passes with seven affirmative votes.

Ordinance No. 55-2019

ADOPTING A TEMPORARY APPROPRIATION ORDINANCE FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2020, UNTIL THE FISCAL YEAR 2020 APPROPRIATION PERMANENT ORDINANCE IS ADOPTED BY CITY COUNCIL

Mrs. Emerson made a motion to adopt Ordinance No. 55-2019; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded.

Ordinance No. 55-2019 passes with seven affirmative votes.

Old Business

Mr. Anderson: I wanted to take us back to a conversation that occurred in the June 20, 2018 meeting. We had some discussion at the time about public notice and notifications of meetings for the Council and subcommittee meetings. Since the end of 2018, it's come to my attention that our primary mode of notification for the public, keep in mind I'm not talking about legal notification, but notification to the public, was notifying the (Cincinnati) Enquirer through a website in web-form, which is perfectly appropriate in general. Since some time during the end of 2018, the Enquirer seems to have made changes either in their editorial process or their technology where they're no longer or at least have not published any of the notices publically on their site that we have submitted. So, we've had a number of meetings, our regular meetings and special meetings where, at least from that side of things, those notices haven't gone out, at least publically visible and that may be because of the way the Enquirer changed how they've integrated with public notice sites themselves or it might editorial. So, with that in mind, we had talked at that time about amending or adjusting Council rules to maybe include public notification on our own digital properties. We talked about Facebook and the front page of our website. We've made a good effort to do that since then. I bring it up now because we haven't had those notices flow through as well, I'm concerned that interested public parties might not be able to easily find what used to be available publically. So, I'm asking if we could consider updating our Council rules through ordinance to just formalize the fact that we will publicize all of our Council meetings and subcommittee meetings through our digital property and not rely just on the Enquirer to make a decision to make that available to the public. I feel like that's one of the duties we have is being open and honest and visible and transparent and I think that's one way we could reaffirm just as more and more people are not reading the newspaper, the fact that it's not being posted publically digitally just reinforces it's probably the right time for us to adjust our rules. So, I wanted to see if we could do that.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: I agree with Mr. Anderson that transparency is always best. We are up here working for the people. The City Administration does endeavor every time to make sure that it is posted on the City's Facebook page, and on the City's website. If Council does decide to make that change, I'm sure that Administration would have no problem honoring that. We already do what you're asking, so, I don't know if you actually want to go through the process of making a change.

Mr. Anderson: I do. The reason is two-fold. One of them is at the time we discussed it last, those things were flowing through, so, we had that stop-gap. Best effort is understandable and it's not a shot that you're not making that effort and, for the most part, they are posted. But, the Enquirer has changed the way they do things. We have more people that use our sites. I feel like it's a reflection of the time. I do know that, just in this past month, there's been at least two meetings where that didn't happen and I don't know if there's more. I know things happen and people have vacations, or the person who does it is out. It's not any kind of indictment on

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Anderson (continued): the effort, but I think it would be best for just general transparency that we update those rules. I would prefer that we update our rules just to reflect the fact that we want to do that and we should do that and the public should expect that it will happen.

Mr. Hawkins: Mr. Anderson, I agree with you 1000% with regard to transparency and it's important that we do everything we can to make concerted efforts to make sure that we have our meetings publicized. I guess the only question that I'd have with us putting it in our Council rules is I don't know that there's anything different that Council is going to do unless you're calling for Council to do anything different beyond us documenting in our rules that this is something that we are going to adhere to, but from a practical standpoint, nobody on City Council is going to go through and publicize it. It's going to go through the Administration. If, something happens where that falls through the cracks through the Administration, I don't know where the consequence comes back to Council. That's my only question. If we put that in the rules, if the idea is this is something demonstrating that this is important to City Council and Council trying to be held accountable to it, I get that, but, I guess the other side of it is, we're being held accountable for something that we're not actively doing. I don't know what it looks like or where we're going.

Mr. Anderson: I guess from my perspective, it's no different than the current rules that require us to have a public notice. So, there's existing rules that we have to have a public notice. We're fulfilling that legal requirement, at least the legal part of it by filling out this form and sending it to the Enquirer. I think there's another part of our requirement and we're just codifying that and the consequence that would be real if we did that is if we fail to notify the public in the way that we said we would, that that meeting wouldn't occur. I think that is a consequence that we need to understand. If we're doing it like we should, there shouldn't be any real consequences. This is no different than, you don't send the Enquirer notice today as the Chair of the Finance Committee, you rely on the Administration to do that. If that notice didn't go to the Enquirer, and you had a meeting anyway, that meeting, and anything that happened in it, wouldn't be valid. There's consequences for that. This is no different; it's just recognizing that in today's environment, the way the public actually gets notified is through a different mechanism than the newspaper, which, again, up until the end of 2018, was flowing through these requests. So, somebody could search online and say, "Springdale Finance Committee", and you could see there was a meeting notice. Today, there's no way that that happens. So, the meetings that happened this month, I don't know that they are as visible as they could have been and that people haven't seen them to have been in the past years. I'm just trying to reflect that reality and I think there is a consequence. All we're asking for is to codify that and if we don't meet that requirement; that burden that we have to be public about it, that the meeting doesn't happen. Again, we're not voting on it tonight, I'm asking that we prepare the ordinance and we can debate it based on the consequences there. But, I think it's important that we recognize that times have changed and public notice, I think, has changed.

Mr. Hawkins: Mr. Braun, how many other cities are you representing now?

Mr. Braun: Our firm represents 14.

Mr. Hawkins: And with regard to your experience and what you guys are doing, where do we sit in terms of what you see as common practice. Not to say that we have to conform to the least common practice, but, where are we at in terms of what you see normally?

Mr. Braun: There's a variety of ways that people do it. One thing I would caution you about. I think you actually raised the point, which is, if you create requirements that exceed what the current public meeting laws require, then you could be penalized if you don't do that. I'll give you a hypothetical. If we were to amend, as it has been suggested, that it be on Facebook, and Facebook is down, or your website is down, or it's compromised in some way for a period of 24 hours and you don't advertise it. But, you did advertise it, let's say somewhere else. You would set yourself up for liability. One of the things that you may want to think about is rather than codifying it, come up with an Administrative policy that might say, "We will strive to advertise meetings through website, Facebook, Twitter". And, again, you mentioned staying with the times, Facebook may not be the method of communication in 2025; that it is in 2019. So, maybe you more generally word it, "electronic means, print

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Braun (continued): means, and posting". Even though I'm not a big fan of posting, there are people who like to see things posted. So, what I might suggest is that allow Staff to come up with a combination or a hybrid of those communities that I've seen. I can tell you that many communities, the City of Loveland just got done debating their new Charter and they had a healthy discussion about whether electronic means on the website should satisfy the legal posting requirements for things. And, ultimately, residents said, "No. We like to hold it in front of us and see it in the paper." So, I think having that discussion is healthy, but, I would very much caution you against creating a situation where, should there be a mistake, the City would be exposed to liability, but I think you can meet those transparency needs by still making some "tweaks". I'll put it that way. I think it's always healthy to look at the means by which you do it, but rather than codifying it, you may want to consider a policy. That's my thoughts.

President Vanover: Well, and you bring up a good point. We don't know what over the horizon changes are going to occur as far as, especially on the electronic side. As a matter of fact, I know for a fact an organization that I've been in and out of and associated with that their Facebook page was absconded with two months ago and they've been trying, I'm not sure it was complete ransomware, but, and that's a perfect example of what happens. Well, you can say, "security" and all that stuff, but you put it out there and somebody is out there in their pajamas in mom and dad's basement looking to crack the code.

Mr. Anderson: I do enjoy wearing pajamas around the house, it's quite comfortable (laughter), especially these cold days. Just to be clear though, I'm not saying that it has to be Facebook, I don't even have a Facebook account, so I'm not abdicating Facebook. Digital assets, I think is a different way you could describe it. It could be City-controlled assets. I think there's a number of ways you could do it. I guess my concern is we need to be consistent and open. I don't want to focus too much on transparency, because I'm not implying that we're trying to hide these meetings. I'm just calling out the fact that what we used to rely on to make the public have an opportunity to be involved, where as before, we could rely on a simple search to look for a meeting that was publicized legally, no longer works. It doesn't. It's not possible. There's at least two meetings this month that happened that were completely invisible to someone who is actively looking to see that meeting. I, myself was searching for one of those meetings and couldn't find it; knowing that it was going to happen. I wanted to see, "how does this happen". We're talking about Finance and the budget for 2020. It's what we're focused on right now. I was actively searching every day for that meeting to see how it would show up, and it never did, and that's a problem. So, I'm asking what we can do to fix that. I'm fine with starting with a policy, but I think we should consider adjusting our rules to account for whatever that policy is. A policy can be changed at any time by the Administration. These are the City Council rules. I'd be even fine saying that, "codify the rule that the policy be done" because there should be consequences. I understand liability, but there should be consequences. If we're not meeting the burden to notify the public of the meeting, we shouldn't have the meeting. And, if we do, there should be a consequence for that, even if it affects the way that we run business. That's what we're charged with doing. So, I feel very strongly about that and maybe we start with a policy, but I think we should consider and ordinance to at least codify at least whatever that policy is. Thank you.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I have a question and pardon me if this is way off base, but how are we supposed to know if it is definitely publicized or not at the date unless we're actively searching every single day to see if it is, in fact, on the internet somewhere we wouldn't know if it's actually. Most people, that I know, in this City, they don't actively search, online, every single day to find out when our meetings are or where our meetings are. I have actually talked to people about this and the publicizing of the meetings and most people are like, "Well, you guys announce it". When we announce our meetings and that was what they used as their major mode of when our meeting is happening.

Mr. Anderson: I understand that concern. I think how we do it is up for discussion and there are ways on the technology side for people to subscribe to updates. Our event page is great. It's right on the front page and says it's there. All I'm asking is for us to set some expectations for ourselves and to let the public know what they can expect for that communication in terms of who's actively checking to make sure that it happens. I don't think it's unreasonable for a Chairperson of a committee, there aren't that many, and there aren't that many meetings, to set the expectation that, before they gavel the meeting, that they check to see if it's been posted. I don't think that's an unfair burden for us, as elected officials, or

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mr. Anderson (continued): appointed officials, to simply look on the front page of the website and see, "Hey, my meeting is posted there; then I could expect, because I've told people, that's where it is". It's not a high bar for people to reach. Planning meets once a month, and, if there's a special meeting, you know about it. Before you go to that meeting, just go to the front page of the website and say, "Yes, it's publically available; we've met that commitment." I don't mean to sit here and lecture. I just think we haven't talked about it in over a year, and the situation has changed and I want to make sure that we're doing something on it. Thank you.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: I think in the past year, I think, unless I'm terribly wrong, the only meeting that hasn't been posted on the City's website was the Finance Committee. There were two meetings. So, in the past year there were two meetings that haven't...

Mr. Anderson: This month, there were two.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Right.

Mr. Anderson: I don't know if there were more.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: They've been posted so, I can tell you the procedure that we do if there is a special meeting. There are two different people in the City that we email. One sends it to the (Cincinnati) Enquirer, and the other posts it to the City's Facebook page and to the City's calendar. I think that, maybe we're making a mountain out of a molehill on this one, because it happens so infrequently. Administration acknowledges that that one was missed and it was corrected with this meeting that we had this evening at 6:30 which was properly advertised both to the Enquirer and on the City's website. It's definitely up to Council on what you want to do with that, but, I can assure you that Administration is making every effort to make sure that the public is completely aware of every meeting that we hold.

Mr. Hawkins: I just want to be clear with regard to the Finance Committee event that now, was deemed legally a meeting, December 5th, that did meet the legal requirements, while it didn't meet what we discussed previously, in terms of posting on the website and on Facebook, just as a point of clarity. Is it reasonable to codify an Administrative policy?

Mr. Braun: Yes. You can certainly do it. You can even, as it's being suggested, codify and make it a requirement that "x" meeting or "y" meeting is advertised in a certain way. You can also maybe do more of what I was suggesting, which is where you give options. We will do it this way, this way, or this way. Or, you can say, "We'll do all of them". But, absolutely you can codify your meetings. Right now, you can codify how a special meeting is advertised. It states that personal delivery must be made if there is an emergency meeting, for instance to each of you so that you know when it occurs, should there be a need for a catastrophic event in the City. So, we already codify certain notice requirements. Mr. Anderson is correct, that right now, and I researched it in anticipation of some of these questions, we're required to provide notice right now and we satisfy that legally as he indicated, by advising and giving notice to the media and, to anyone else who has requested notice. So, we satisfy the legal burden. What he's asking, I think, is to take it a step higher. And, again, it's up to Council as to how high you want to take that level.

Mr. Hawkins: If we codify it as a policy though, do we sit in the same position with regard to potential liability as we would if we made that a Council rule? Is there any difference where it's..?

Mr. Braun: Well, sure, I think the consequences come from potentially invalidating action the City would do. So, that would be the liability you would risk. Are there the same risk of attorney's fees and things like that, statutory punishments? I would argue, no. But, I would say is one of the concerns that you had about making sure we over protected ourselves with the Finance meeting tonight is, had we taken action, a resident could potentially challenge that and invalidate it. So, to me, that could create exposure if we were approving a contract and we acted on it or we initiated an appropriation; that could be invalidated. So, yes, I think you are exposing yourself, but, I think you have to decide how much notice is enough.

Mr. Hawkins: Thank you Mr. President.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

President Vanover: Well, Council, do we want to direct Mr. Braun to do a synopsis of usual and typical and take that information and go forward from there?

Mr. Anderson: I would love to see at least an option in this space. And, even if it starts with Rules and Laws and see what that looks like. We're not voting on it tonight, but I think it would be prudent just to see what that would look like and then take it to Rules and Laws and bring it to the group over the next couple of meetings just to make sure. Even if it doesn't change, then we've done our due diligence and set an expectation with the public what communication should be and why. Each one of us will have to decide that risk versus reward and the liability question. I think I've made my "coming in" view very clear that I feel like that liability I'm comfortable with because I think the burden to notice is real and high to me. But, I think it's reasonable to at least have an option go through Rules and Laws. That would be my preference.

President Vanover: Well then, I guess we'll direct Mr. Braun to give us a report on what's out there, what's going on.

Mr. Braun: You want me to take that through Rules and Laws at their next meeting?

President Vanover: I would say, "No", just bring that back to Council because then it would be our discussion to carry it.

Mr. Braun: Why don't I prepare a memorandum for Council that you can then discuss at a meeting that will give you an analysis of what some other communities have done, codified policy, and what means as Mr. Hawkins suggested and then, from there, maybe it will initiate some discussion.

President Vanover: Sure.

Mr. Braun: I'll prepare that for Council.

Mr. Anderson: Thank you. That would be great.

New Business

Mrs. Zimmerlin: I have two items for this evening. The first one is what we discussed earlier during the budget discussion. We are requesting that the Police locker room renovations bids be rejected entirely so that we can go back out to bid. That can be done by motion.

President Vanover: Council do we have a motion?

Mr. Hawkins: I move to reject the locker room renovation bids that Administration received and move that we go back out to bid.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Second.

Motion to reject the locker room renovation bids that Administration received and move that Administration go back out to bid was approved with seven affirmative votes.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Also, all of you should have received a letter dated December 11th, 2019 from Mr. Steve Galster, the Secretary of the Springdale Planning Commission with the revisions that are being recommended for the changes to the Zoning Code. Administration would request that we do a first reading on the first meeting in January, which is the 8th and then a Public Hearing and a second reading on January 15th.

Mrs. McNear: Council, we have an economic development transfer request for a liquor license from Streetscape Holding LLC at 11711 Princeton Pike, Suite 231. This is for the Blue Ash Chili and they have requested a D5. D5 is "spirituous liquor for on-premises consumption; only beer, wine and mixed beverages for an on premises or off premises in a provisional sealed containers until 2:30 a.m.". We have done a couple of these in the past where we have just taken this to Council, and if there's no objection, then we'll sign off on this and send this in.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mrs. McNear (continued): Mayor Webster, if you would like to add any additional comments. I know this was directed to you initially.

Mayor Webster: I got a call from the ownership at Blue Ash Chili and they were transferring this from one of their other facilities. So, it's not like they've gone out somewhere and bought it, but they have it in hand now and they just want to move it to this store from another one.

Mrs. McNear: Any objections or questions, comments? (None) If not, I'll take care of the paperwork. Thank you.

President Vanover: Mayor Webster, did you have anything beyond that?

Mayor Webster: No.

Meetings and Announcements

Mrs. Emerson: The Board of Health will meet on January 9th at 7:00 in the conference room adjacent to here.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Planning Commission will meet on Tuesday, January 14th at 7:00 p.m. in these chambers.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: First, I would like to let everyone know that the Police Department, once again, was awarded the AAA Platinum Safety Traffic Award. The Platinum Award is the highest award that AAA offers and it's the 15th straight year that our agency has won the award. It's all due to our patrol officers working auto crashes and enforcing our traffic laws on a continuous basis and using our speed sign and to warn people about speeding in residential areas and documenting traffic flows there. They also teach third grade safety belt program in schools and the DARE program teaches the dangers of drug and alcohol and then we also do the Tri-County Mall Safety Town where they learn school bus safety. We participate in OVI Task Force and OVI checkpoints and the Click It or Ticket Campaign. Our Police Department does a fantastic job with that and we're very proud of them. I also wanted to let everyone know that the Shop With A Hero Event takes place tomorrow. There are 40 children who will be going out with Police Officers and other community people to Target to buy Christmas presents for their families and then they will also have a meal at the Community Center sponsored by Chick-fil-A. I also have a couple of announcements from the Park and Rec Department. Adult sports registration is currently underway for women's volleyball and adult racquetball. Both leagues play in January. There is an employment opportunity at the Rec Center. Applications are being accepted for the position of part-time park maintenance worker and detailed information is available on the City's website and at the Community Center. Just as a reminder, Christmas Eve, the Community Center is open from 9:00 a.m. until 5:00 p.m. and the track and fitness center opens at 6:00 a.m. City offices are open that day. Christmas day, the Recreation Center and City offices are closed. New Year's Eve, the Recreation Center is open from 9:00 a.m. until 5:00 p.m. and the track and Fitness Center opens at 6:00 a.m. City offices are open that day. On New Year's Day, the city offices are closed.

Mayor Webster: Friday, January 3rd, we will have our induction in the Coach's Hall of Fame. We've got three people going in this year; four. Don't ask me which four. I can name three, but I can't name the fourth one. But, anyway, several of them are members of the Boosters and 6:00.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: 6:30

Mayor Webster: 6:00?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: 6:30.

Mayor Webster: Okay, somewhere between six and seven, we're going to do this. So, if you show up at six, you won't be late. But, it's a very nice affair and it's called the Youth Sports Pep Rally and the boosters have done a good job of jazzing it up a little bit. I think last

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

Mayor Webster (continued): year they had a deejay there and, anyway, it's a real nice event. Come out and help us. Let's see, we've got the four people named here. Mr. Bill Reisenberg, who was a coach. Ms. Marilyn Horman, who was a long time booster member. Mr. Dave Bloomberg, who was very active in the Community Center and a number of different ways. And, Mrs. Sherry Byrd who was very active with the Boosters for many, many years. Those are the four inductees into the Hall of Fame.

Mrs. Ghantous: Board of Zoning Appeals will meet on Tuesday, January 28th in the Council chambers here at 7:00.

Communications from the Audience - None

Update on legislation still in development

Mr. Hawkins: As you look at your Internal Memorandum, Item Number I was addressed with Ordinance No. 53-2019; An Ordinance Setting the Employee Pay Rates for 2020 and Declaring an Emergency. That passed with a 7-0 vote. Item Number II was addressed with Ordinance No. 54-2019; An Ordinance Adopting the Final Appropriation and Transfer Ordinance for 2019. That passed with a 7-0 vote. Item Number III was addressed with Ordinance No. 55-2019; An Ordinance Adopting a Temporary Appropriations Ordinance for the Period January 1, 2020 until the Fiscal Year 2020 Appropriations Permanent Ordinance is Adopted by City Council. That passed with 7-0 vote. All other matters are forthcoming.

Recap of legislative items requested for next Council meeting

There's a request for a Resolution Authorizing the City of Springdale's Participation in Financing Public Improvements in Cooperation with the Port Authority and Authorizing the Execution of Documents to Effectuate Such Financing, and Declaring an Emergency. There's a request for An Ordinance Adopting the Annual Appropriations/ Estimated Receipts for Fiscal Year Ending December 31, 2020. There's a request for A Resolution Authorizing the Investment of Municipal Funds. There is a request for A Resolution Requesting Advance Payment from the County Auditor. There's a request for An Ordinance Enacting and Adopting the 2019 S-21 Supplement to the Springdale Code of Ordinances and Declaring an Emergency. There's also a request for An Ordinance Allowing for the Issuance of Tickets Produced by Computer or Other Electronic Means by the Springdale Police Department. Mrs. Zimmerlin is that a request regarding Planning Commission fall within the request for the other text amendments or is it separate?

Mrs. Zimmerlin: It's separate.

Mr. Hawkins: There's also a request for a first reading regarding amendments requested by the Planning Commission for some text amendments and that concludes requests for legislation unless there's anything else from Council or the Administration.

President Vanover: Also, on the text amendments we'll have to schedule a public hearing for the January 15th meeting.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Yes, sir.

City of Springdale Council

December 18, 2019

President Vanover: Just a reminder to everyone here and out there, New Year's Day is Wednesday. We will not meet that day. We will meet the following week. Which is the 8th and then we will have a backup the next week. So, back to backs.

Adjournment

Mr. Hawkins made a motion to adjourn; Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded the motion and Council adjourned at 8:49 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kathy McNear
Clerk of Council/Finance Director

Minutes Approved:
Tom Vanover, President of Council

_____, 2020