

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

President of Council Vanover called Council to order on January 17, 2018.

The governmental body and those in attendance recited the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mrs. McNear provided the Invocation.

President Vanover requested a moment of silence in remembrance of the passing of Margaret Squires.

Mrs. McNear took roll call. Council members Anderson, Emerson, Ghantous, Hawkins, Shroyer, Sullivan-Wisecup and Vanover were present.

The minutes of the January 3, 2018 City Council meeting were considered.

Mrs. Emerson made a motion to adopt; Mrs. Ghantous seconded. The minutes were adopted as published with seven affirmative votes.

Mayor Webster: We are pleased this evening to have with us four gentleman from the Better Bus Coalition and they would like to make a presentation tonight of their proposal for a county-wide bus expansion improvement and rapid transit system. Mr. Cam Hardy is the person that contacted me, so he will lead it off and introduce his cast of characters here. Mr. Hardy.

Mr. Hardy: How's everybody doing? Thank you Mayor Webster for having me today. I am Cam Hardy, I am the President of the Better Bus Coalition. We are a grass roots organization fighting for better bus service in Hamilton County. There are a lot of jobs unreachable by transit. Our bus system is made basically for the 70's. It's very outdated and outmoded. We don't connect correctly to jobs and to job centers and so myself and these gentlemen, as well as others; we band together and what we did was we crisscrossed the County and we met with residents, business owners, leaders of the community and we created a bus plan because, quite frankly, a lot of people complain but they don't have any kind of plan or any kind of solution for the problem. Instead of us complaining, we came with a solution. We created a plan and we have been presenting our plan to various cities across the County as well as in the City of Cincinnati and just everywhere else and so we wanted to come and just introduce ourselves and kind of introduce our plan and our future for the system and our future for this region. We think that improving transportation is crucial to having a sustainable future and reaching jobs and a healthy environment. So, I would like to have Mark, our Data Manager, Isaac and Andrew, they participated and they also helped with the data. They're going to kind of break down some of the numbers and also, it was kind of a haul getting up here. I personally took the 23x because I work downtown, but these gentlemen took the 78 and had to walk the rest of the way, so it's kind of a haul and we're doing this also to kind of raise awareness for ourselves because we're hitting parts of the County that aren't really served well by bus service. We want to fix that and we want to know that you have an ally out here in fixing bus service. I'll get off my soapbox and let the gentlemen talk about the data and everything else.

Mr. Samaan: Hello, my name is Mark Samaan. Actually, I have some fact sheets for you all and I'll pass those out real quick. I don't have enough for everyone because I didn't know how many there were going to be.

Mayor Webster: Is that data in this plan?

Mr. Samaan: This is specific to Springdale.

Mayor Webster: Okay, thank you.

Mr. Samaan: So, unlike the rest of my colleagues here, I actually drove here today because after this I need to get somewhere on the east side. If I was to take a bus there, it would take an hour and a half to two hours. I don't have that kind of time. Which speaks to our County's 4% transit usage for commute. People make decisions based on time and money. It's as simple as that. So, I was doing a little research on Springdale. I used to live in the Fields Ertel area when I was a kid, so I spent a lot of time around here, easy access

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan (continued): by highway and as I've learned; not so easy access by bus unless you're coming from downtown and during peak. So that addresses what our system has been, which is a commuting system based on downtown, based on the nine to five workday. Which, 40 years ago, was great, but now, it doesn't work. Downtown Cincinnati is still the largest employment center. It still draws the vast majority of Metro's usage, but we've seen job centers move to places like Blue Ash, to Sharonville, to Springdale, to Colerain and then out of the County as well; Butler County, Warren County and Northern Kentucky counties. So our system is just not set up to move people efficiently between those places. For example, if I was in Mt. Healthy and I wanted to go to Wyoming. They're pretty much right next to each other, separated by Springfield Township. It's about a ten minute drive. If I wanted to take a bus, I could take the 17 down into Cincinnati, transfer to the 51 Crosstown, get off when I get to Vine Street, transfer to the 78 and be in Wyoming, about an hour and a half. Obviously I'm not going to make that trip by bus, unless I have to and I don't have any other access. It's no secret that the vast majority of people that use Metro make less than \$35,000 a year. That comes from most people who use Metro using it out of necessity instead of out of choice, although the express buses do draw some choice riders. When we were creating our plan we looked at the things that people told us. Which is Crosstown service, better express service, faster service overall, especially places that are not in the city. One prime corridor for new bus service, should a Metro Levy pass in Hamilton County, is Kemper Road. Metro planners have been talking about this for a while, but they don't have the funding to implement it. Essentially the biggest change would be that Crosstown service on Kemper connecting Northgate Mall area to the Fields Ertel area. Just running straight across Kemper Road. In our plan, we also have a bus rapid transit system which is based on the old planning for the rail projects back in the early 2000's. We modified it to take the form of bus rapid transit instead. Because, for the price of one rail line, we could build like four bus rapid transit lines and blanket the county. In our plan, two lines would serve; two rapid transit lines would serve the Springdale area, specifically around Tri-County Mall. The line that would run up and down Reading Road and the line that would run up and down Route 4, Springfield Pike and Vine Street into Cincinnati. So those are some of the things that Springdale could see specifically from our plan, but what I wanted to impart mostly with you all is that Springdale and none of the other suburban counties, suburban townships, suburban municipalities are not going to see any new service unless Hamilton County is the funder of the bus system. Right now, the City of Cincinnati is the sole local funder with dedicated funding paying for the bus system. This is why all of the routes outside of Cincinnati go in to Cincinnati and that's it. The reason being that, Cincinnati City Council controls the SORTA Board because they pay for it. They're not going to prioritize new routes outside of the city before new routes in the city. Should a Hamilton County Sales Tax Levy pass, the board structure will change and the County will dominate the board. There would be more, obviously Cincinnati being the largest city, and still having most of the service, will have a presence on that board. But, the board would be controlled by County Commissioners and whatever sort of Advisory Boards they set up which may include members from each municipality in Hamilton County for example. So, if you all have any questions about transit service up here or what the needs of transit up here in Springdale, when I say up here, I live in Cincinnati, that's why I say up here, the needs of transit users in Springdale as well as the people who don't use transit may benefit from it. I'd be happy to answer any questions for you all or talk about some of the plan or some of the numbers on this page here.

Mr. Anderson: For starters, I spent a fair amount of time reviewing your website and your data and, as a former data scientist and managing analytics team for a number of years, it was nice to see the data being used, public data being used that way. I know a lot of it came from the Metro raw data set, so I appreciated reviewing that. So that was good work and I appreciated reading the plan. I wonder if you could give some comments on what you think about a lot of the changes that are going on in the SORTA right now. I understand the current Board President or Commissioner has resigned early and there's a number of openings already being addressed. I noticed that City Council has been talking about raising or supporting a tax increase as well. Just not to the extent that you are proposing. I wonder what's your view on the changes that are happening and how does that change the proposals that you are making?

Mr. Hardy: Well, from a quotient standpoint, we're disappointed to see the chairman go. However, we think that it's a great opportunity to put some bus riders on the board. For

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Hardy (continued): the longest, we believe that our voices have been left out of this entire conversation. That Board has been politicized so much that nothing has gotten done. We think that the County Commissioners and the city and our city leaders have a great opportunity now to add some value to the board and some voices to the board that they have not heard from. I think we kind of took them by storm when we stormed into their meetings and say, "Look you guys need to change some things before you guys go to the community and ask for more money". I think that now, again, it's a great opportunity for us to have some different perspectives on the Board. I hope that answers your question.

Mr. Anderson: It does. I guess I'm curious what the difference is. Because they've said some of the same things that you've been saying, at least in the changes. In the transition area, they're saying that they want more representation of people who ride the buses and they've talked about sustaining service and they're looking at accessibility concerns that have come up. So, it sounds like you're making progress. There's going to have to be a decision soon, right, because they're going to make a proposal. So you're doing these tours, what is it that you're looking for communities like ours to do? I do ride the bus. Whenever I go downtown I think it's easier. We go to the main library, we take the kids down to the MakerSpace. It's just easier. That type of service is good. We'd never had to go across communities, then I understand that concern, but what are you looking for from communities like ours when you're doing this tour?

Mr. Hardy: Well, basically, we're here to start a conversation. In my research, and in our research of doing this, there has been no kind of a conversation, especially in our larger municipalities about this and so we're here just to start a conversation to let people know that there is an advocacy group. We don't work for Metro, we don't take any direction from Metro or SORTA or anything like that. We're just people that ride the bus every day and we're concerned about every day bus riders and we want it to get better for everybody. So, we're just here introducing ourselves. We really don't particularly want anything from you guys. We're just here saying, "Hello, we're here. Reach out to us if you have any questions or concerns." I'll pass out my cards after I speak. We're not asking for anything. We're not asking for any commitments, we're not asking for you to say anything, we're just here introducing ourselves.

Mr. Shroyer: Some time ago, I listened to a presentation that was put on at the OKI (Ohio Kentucky Indiana) Regional Government. That discussion centered obviously around funding. Also, they spent a lot of time on what they called the "First Mile" and the "Last Mile". The issue that, as you mentioned, the bus only comes so far and then you walk. That coupled with the fact that we are a county border city and that the north border of our city is also the north border of Hamilton County and there's an overlap with Butler County. Does your plan address that overlap and are you looking strictly at Hamilton County service or whether there is a working relationship or possibility for a working relationship to overlap both directions? I mean, obviously there's a work force in Butler County that would work in Hamilton County. There's a work force in Hamilton County that would work in Butler County, if they could get there. It sounds to me like what you're looking at is more of a county wide service as opposed to the current "get you into Cincinnati and get you back out". Are you looking beyond that?

Mr. Samaan: So, my day job is working for OKI actually. I work as a Land Use Intern until I finish my Masters. In terms of the regional approach, with multi counties, we believe that the other counties around Hamilton County will not sign on to join SORTA or whatever form Metro takes until Hamilton County gets its act together with transit. Butler County has their own transit system. As does the City of Middletown and Hamilton as part of that and Oxford. Their ridership has exploded in the past five years. In 2010, their transit agency moved about 30,000 people a year and in 2015 it moved over half a million people a year. That's because they expanded it beyond being an access ride service to being one with scheduled routes, taking specific routes and not an on demand service. They did this because it met their needs. In terms of our plan, in terms of the route planning, we only deal with Hamilton County. We still want to get Hamilton County residents out to job centers. Right now, Metro does run a few, what they call "job connection" routes which are reverse commute. You can pretty much only get on them from downtown Cincinnati. Because it is primarily meant to move city residents out. For example, there's the 42, which takes people from downtown out to Tylersville Road and sort of does a loop in the West Chester area.

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan (continued): We would like to see those routes not necessarily just expanded in terms of that route running more, but that type of service leaving from other transit hubs in Hamilton County. So, in our plan, for example, there are 11 transit hubs. One of which being Tri County Mall. As I understand it now, Tri County Mall area is where the Butler County system meets the Hamilton County system. So, in the long term, we would love to see each county join a regional transit commission that would probably have to be created by the State of Ohio. For right now, our plan does focus solely on approving service within Hamilton County, but we'd still want to see connections to Butler, to Warren, to Clermont counties as well. There's already connections to TANK downtown Cincinnati, but in the short term, the routes will mostly focus on getting and serving Hamilton County residents.

Mr. Hawkins: It sounds like finances are a significant issue in all this. With the plan that you guys are looking at, the ideas that you guys are looking at in terms of the expansion and making the bus routes more effective and efficient, do you have an estimate on the cost that you think it would cost increased from where we are right now to pull this off?

Mr. Hardy: Basically, we primarily, as Mark said earlier, we primarily fund the system based off of a .3 earnings tax. If you work in the City of Cincinnati, but live in the suburbs, you pay into it. If you work in the suburbs, but live in the suburbs, you don't. We're proposing that the .3 earnings tax comes back to the taxpayers, people that work in the city, but they may live in the county, but they get that money back and we switch into a sales tax which will cost a person \$.34 a day to fund better bus service and it would capture and I would also add that over half of the people that are paying into the sales tax would not even live in Hamilton County. It would be people that are visiting or people from Indiana, or people from wherever if they're coming here for games or concerts or what have you. If you're paying that sales tax, you're funding Metro. I believe it's a bigger net because right now we're only capturing the people that pay an earnings tax. There has been multiple studies that show that that way of funding is no longer sustainable. We are not drawing in the amount of money that we are putting out. There are roughly 101 buses that are past their useful lifespan. A useful lifespan is 12 years. We have 101 buses that are past that. We have, I believe that the oldest bus system is 19 years old. I believe I ride it frequently. I live in Mt. Airy, so it breaks down on Colerain a lot. There has been times where I had to walk the rest of the way home. I just think about some of the elderly people that I stand at bus stops with and women with children and I just feel so sorry for them that they have to walk the rest of the way home because the bus is breaking down.

Mr. Hawkins: So, I appreciate the fact that you've found a way where you can get additional money or you've developed a plan or an idea for getting more money, but I guess the question is, is there a target amount based, and I don't know if you guys have determined this based on the things you have studied and seen, but is there a target amount that it's going to cost to do this based on the number of routes or the number of new buses or anything like that? I don't know if you have that answer or not, but I was more curious if that is something that you guys had determined when looking at all this?

Mr. Samaan: Yes, so that's the same question that Denise Treehouse asked us. What we told her was that right now, Metro is a \$160 million dollar agency. They spend \$106 million dollars a year. \$94 million dollars of that comes from earnings tax, federal sources, the little bit of money that they get from the State, fares, and all that good stuff. With the rest coming from grants that they apply for every year. Usually through OKI.

Mr. Hawkins: Federal grants?

Mr. Samaan: Yes. So those are the grants they use to replace the buses. Unless they are going to cut some more routes to pay for the new buses, there's no money left in the budget. In terms of our plan that we wrote with all of the routes in it, with the bus rapid transit system, with 14 cross town routes, with expanded service on the local routes and the transit hubs comes out to a \$200 million dollars a year agency. So, Almost double. That's if they do every single thing in that plan.

Mr. Hawkins: Through the course of your investigations and studies, are there any other cities around that you've looked at where you like how they do what they do? Is Columbus, Franklin County better, Cuyahoga and Cleveland?

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan: Cleveland is a whole another beast because they have a legacy rail system, but Columbus, I see Columbus as a model for us. They re-did their network with the funding that they had. Although they had some wiggle room in their budget to do that and they had to pay consultants fees and all that. They ended up re-doing their system around their grid. Columbus is much more of a grid than Cincinnati than the Greater Cincinnati region is, but we can do a similar thing here. It won't be a grid it will be more of a web. They looked at their routes, they looked at what's being served and where people are actually going, not necessarily just on buses; just in general. Where people live, where they are going, where do they hang out after work, things like that. They modeled a new network off of those travel patterns. Now a lot of the network is the same, but what they ended up doing was changing sort of the ends of the routes. They moved away from having branched routes that split at some point, just one route, way less confusing. That's one city. Houston is another city that did a very similar thing. Houston is also more of a grid, but it's also a much larger scale city. There's was a bit more complicated. There are plenty of cities that are doing what we want to do. The difference between those cities and Greater Cincinnati is that those cities have wiggle room in their budget. We do not.

Mr. Hawkins: Thank you.

Mayor Webster: A couple of questions. I don't hear too well, so I didn't hear the answer about Cleveland. How do they fund their system up in Cleveland?

Mr. Samaan: Every single major city in Ohio, usually they talk about eight cities in Ohio, their transit agency is funded with a county-wide sales tax.

Mayor Webster: County-wide sales tax?

Mr. Samaan: Yes. Cincinnati, Greater Cincinnati/Hamilton County is the only major city/county in Ohio that does not do this.

Mr. Hardy: Toledo doesn't as well. They fund theirs by a property tax.

Mr. Samaan: Yes, but they are pushing for a sales tax levy this year as well.

Mayor Webster: Alright. Here's my question. I've used the transit system; it's been awhile, but I used to use it riding downtown when I worked down there. I was very pleased with the service. You get on the bus, boom downtown; a lot better than driving, a lot cheaper and everything else. It seems like that's the easy part of it if you're just going downtown and back. But, where it gets a little hairy is when if Jeff wants to go over to the east side and Meghan wants to go to the west side and Holly wants to go somewhere in between. If you started with a clean sheet of paper, how would you design a bus system that would eliminate people having to walk long distances?

Mr. Hardy: Our bus plan. We started with a clean sheet. We looked at a grid system at first. We recognized right away that that would not work here because of the landscape of the city and the county. Then we just hit the ground running, we went everywhere or we were asking people what was their vision and the plan that we came up with is what people have said that they wanted.

Mayor Webster: So you think you've got a plan that would adequately service the area?

Mr. Hardy: Absolutely, absolutely.

Mayor Webster: So now you just need the dollars to implement it.

Mr. Hardy: Absolutely and the political will to make it happen.

Mayor Webster: That's the easy part, right?

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan: So basically the future transit system will have more service on the arterial roads so that would be your Route 4, your Reading Road, your Montgomery, your Beechmont, your Glenway or Hamilton, Colerain; all those roads, Winton. So those would obviously get beefed up service. They're already the most heavily used. What changes is that right now the only real hub is downtown and they're sort of building these "mini hubs" in Northside and Oakley. In our plan, the hubs are scattered around the County. So, it's as simple as getting to that hub and now the hub up here is Tri County Mall. Getting to that hub whether it be you walk there or you take a local bus line that runs by you there or you drive and park there or however you want to get there. In the future we may have roving autonomous shuttles that solve the last mile problem that just gets you to the transit stop and then you get on that fast frequent transit in the heavy corridors. Those hubs are connected through the cross town service. So what ends up happening in our plan is that once you get to a hub, you can get anywhere, direct. The most you might have to make is one transfer for you on particularly weird routing. Basically it takes the need to go downtown out. You'll never have to go downtown unless you are going downtown or to Northern Kentucky. That's where we change how it is now.

Mayor Webster: Thank you.

Mr. Shroyer: Does your plan incorporate the existing system and what kind of reception have you gotten from that system? Do you anticipate, if the funding becomes available, do you anticipate a working relationship or do you anticipate a blank sheet of paper and we start over?

Mr. Hardy: We anticipate a working relationship. We have learned that change is hard for most. We did a pretty good job of not really changing the gist of it. We changed a lot of it, but we did not change the main routes to 17, or like mentioned your main artery routes, so those really stay the same, but we kind of changed the way that we look at it as he described, more hubs and neighborhood centers and things like that so that you don't have to make as many transfers or you don't have to go downtown. I think people will be very satisfied with it. We've gotten pretty good reception from it.

Mr. Shroyer: Alright. Thank you.

Mayor Webster: To follow up on Mr. Anderson's question, what would you like to see this government do to help you?

Mr. Hardy: Well, I was thinking about Mr. Anderson's question after I answered it and continue to make motions asking SORTA not to cut your bus routes. That's the number one thing that we can ask you to do. You and Forest Park recently made a resolution recently asking them not to cut the 23x. We greatly appreciate that. They're looking at cutting more routes. We are imploring them that they can't cut their way to prosperity here, but we do understand that you have to balance a budget. You have to make the tough decisions. If you can just continue to ask them to not deteriorate your bus system, your bus routes as they are today.

Mr. Hawkins: I commend you guys on all the work you guys have been doing in the study of addressing the problem with a solution. Particularly the matter of the \$.34 a day and those numbers check out with using approximately 800,000 people in Hamilton County to get that other \$100M. That's pretty impressive when you break it down like that, it doesn't seem like it's that much to handle when you have those kinds of numbers, so I just want to commend you guys on what you're doing and the work and effort that you have put forth to it in finding a solution.

Mr. Hardy: Thank you.

Mr. Samaan: If I may add in on the tax situation. If you are currently paying the Cincinnati Earnings Tax and this comes in to effect and the Earnings Tax is rolled back, it's a net tax cut for the sole reason that the Cincinnati Earnings Tax is a flat tax that is non-refundable. Regardless of your income level, it works out if you make \$15,000 a year, it works out to a savings of \$14 a year. The more money you make, the higher the savings are. That just comes from the tax being more widely collected. There are 270,000 jobs in

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan (continued): the City of Cincinnati and those are the people who fund the bus system. In this case it could be a million people that may pay into the sales tax. People coming in from out of county. Visitors, people who live in the county. So, the tax load is more evenly distributed.

Mr. Parham: Is there currently a ballot issue in place or are you working toward a ballot issue?

Mr. Hardy: SORTA passed a resolution in the middle of last year saying that they were going to go for a ballot initiative this year. We don't know how much that is, what it's going to be, what it's going to look like or even if it is going to happen this year. The reality is that we believe that it has to happen this year. SORTA is at a cliff. Either we continue to build or we fall off of it. The deficits are going to continue to swell after next year from \$20 million dollars to \$40 million dollars. There are going to be very detrimental cuts. The bus route that I ride now only runs once an hour so I can't imagine how it would look after significant cuts to service and things like that. We are kind of pushing SORTA along, we want to show them that their support on the ground for this, again we don't work for them or anything, we're just doing this because we care about it and we think that it's the right thing to do. We're currently circulating a petition and the petition is a "Save Metro Now" petition asking SORTA to go for the levy this year. We have about 1,000 signatures on that right now, so I believe that there is support, today to go this year and we're going to be presenting that to SORTA in the coming weeks.

Mr. Parham: Is that ballot issue to ask for additional funding through earnings tax or is it to ask for a sales tax?

Mr. Hardy: It's going to be to ask for a sales tax. The City would then have to decide what to do with the Earnings Tax and again we are pushing the City to give that money back to us. We want that money back in our pockets. It is not fair that people get double-taxed for transit. We want to be able to tell people that they're getting money back in their pockets because that sales tax is regressive and it hurts the lowest common denominator of people so we want people to have more money in their pockets versus less. We understand that asking people to raise taxes is a tough sell. It's very hard, but it has to be done.

Mr. Parham: How many more visits are you planning that you have scheduled to other communities, to other jurisdictions?

Mr. Hardy: We've talked to basically everyone. We're going to North College Hill, Silverton. We're going to Sharonville, Forest Park. We've got Forest Park coming up in about two weeks now. We're going to hit every place. We're going to hit everywhere. This is not just a city issue. We've been touring the city, but it's time to take this to the county. We plan on going to Colerain Township. I've been in contact with a trustee up there. We're going to be headed up there. We're going to have this conversation with everyone.

Mr. Parham: Okay, and then does your plan identify how you schedule replacing the capital or the buses, and how you create and build the hubs at the same time you keep the system operating?

Mr. Samaan: So, in our plan, we split the budget into operating capital. The capital side of the budget would set aside enough money per year to replace as many buses as the need to. So you have a 12 year lifespan for a regular bus. So that means that every 12 years you're replacing your entire fleet, ideally, you're replacing your entire fleet. Right now, Metro needs to replace 30 buses a year to hit that replacement rate. Last year, 2017, they replaced zero, because they couldn't. In our plan, we project that the size of the bus fleet would almost double, so that means that they would have to replace approximately 60 buses a year. In today's dollars, a bus is anywhere from \$400,000 to \$500,000 dollars and keep in mind these vehicles run hundreds of miles a day every day, all day. They're not going to last 20 years. So in our budget, we portioned out, assuming \$500,000 per bus (we went high end), at 60 buses per year comes out \$30M a year. In our budget, and what we would like SORTA to do is to dedicate money to those capital expenses. Do not mix them with the operating expenses. So this ensures that we do not have this problem again in ten years. To ensure that there's always going to be money for the bus replacements so we don't let

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan (continued): the fleet age to save some money basically. In terms of the building of the bus rapid transit system, in some corridors, that's going to take the form of busways, some corridors it's going to take the form of bus lanes and in some corridors, there wouldn't actually be a dedicated infrastructure on the street, but we would take advantage of technologies like smart sensors, smart traffic lights to move the most amount of people on our streets. Because, the point of transportation is not to move the most amount of vehicles, it's to move the most amount of people. I don't like to project more than ten years into the future, because I don't think you can do that reliably unless you're an oracle. In the next ten years there's going to be an explosion in smart technologies. Whether it be the form of autonomous vehicles or traffic signal upgrades. Right now, the City is installing a fiber cable around downtown Cincinnati and part of that is so that they can make the traffic lights downtown make decisions on the fly about how the signals should run, how we can, if there's a backup on the east part of downtown, how can we change the traffic lights of this and that and so in our budget we do put aside money not only for the construction of a BRT system, we put aside about \$20 million dollars a year towards that, assuming a federal match would raise about, over 30 years, it would raise \$1.2 billion dollars in today's money for the construction of a system. That's about the cost of one rail line, so we think that will be money very well spent. We also would like to see SORTA dedicate money to those upgrades to those smart technologies so that we don't fall behind as we sometimes do.

Mr. Parham: You talked about a \$200 million, is that the expenses or is that what you anticipate would be your revenue?

Mr. Samaan: They would be both. It would \$200 million dollars spent every year. That would be operating the system, capital expenditures, administration, all that stuff. In order to raise that money, we projected out that it would have to be at least a .75, this was when they still did sales increments in .25, now the State changes the rules, so we can do it in \$.01 increases. We projected that at a \$.75 level. That sales tax would generate \$120 million dollars a year. You would add in the federal funding and the larger your system is, as an urban county, the larger that system is, the more federal money you get. Because it's a formula, so we run more routes, we get more federal money. You add that in, you add in fares. Right now, they collect about \$22 million dollars a year in fares. We expect ridership to go up over the years as the system is built out. You add in how much you'd get from fares, based on a projected increase add, everything, you get the magic number of \$200 million dollars. Assuming no money from the State of Ohio.

Mr. Hardy: We are imploring on them to pass this bill. We are hitting our State legislators with it. It's not just a local issue, it's also a State issue as well.

Mr. Samaan: Right. Part of the reason we're in this financial debacle now anyway, is that the State of Ohio has been cutting the money it gives to local governments, you know. I don't have to tell you.

Mr. Hardy: I will also say that we spend more mowing the grass along the highway than we do on public transit in this state and that's a fact.

Mr. Parham: Last question. As I understand your model here, as you're trying to generate the revenue to cover this \$200 million, you would continue the current routes as they are and you begin to add the cross town routes.

Mr. Hardy: Well, we'd do some restructuring of the routes, but yes, that's basically, yes sir.

Mr. Samaan: It's basically based on how fast can the buses arrive here.

Mr. Parham: I have one more question. How long does it take to build one bus and who are the manufacturers out there that are trying to build these 60 buses a year just for this community?

Mr. Samaan: In America, we actually do have a pretty big bus building manufacturing base. Not as big as it once was, but most of Metro's buses right now come from a manufacturer called Gillig and they produce the typical 40 foot long bus. The one you see

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Samaan (continued): every day. In this case, because Metro will be buying so many buses per year, it would probably get a contract with one manufacturer. We expect them to go for the hybrid diesel buses in the short term and eventually move to all electric buses as the technology improves. Issues about battery life and horsepower and all that are still getting solved today by engineers. Gillig is one company, there are a couple of other companies that produce solely electric buses or solely diesel buses. We think they're going to move away from the diesel bus model just because of the price of gas. A diesel bus would get about five miles to the gallon, a hybrid bus gets about seven, it's a 40% fuel savings so they love that, less money in the long term. So basically a bus, depending on the size of the order can take six months to year when an order is placed.

Mr. Parham: For all 60 to arrive?

Mr. Samaan: Yes. It's much faster than building a train, because they pump out thousands of new buses a year. They have the manufacturing capacity. I don't know where there plant is actually located, but I think it's somewhere in the near south.

Mr. Parham: Okay. Thank you.

Mrs. Emerson: I have one question on the size of the Metro buses. You see them go around all the time and they're a third full if that. Would it be an advantage to build the smaller buses; have more of them running the routes?

Mr. Hardy: That is definitely an option. I hear that a lot as far as empty buses and that is kind of a threefold thing. It depends on where the bus is; the reason that it is empty. It could be near a layover, or it could be returning from a layover or it could be out of service as the reason that it is empty. To answer your question directly, yes we are in support of diversifying the fleet. We don't believe that it really saves money, but it does give the perception that we're not wasting as much money riding that big old bus out and it's empty.

Mr. Samaan: Right now, Metro owns five 30 foot buses. So these are the smaller ones. Those are all hybrids and they all run on the Mt. Adams route because that's a route that gets maybe 120 people a day. It doesn't run very frequently. A 40 foot bus for example would have a seating capacity of 35 to 40 people. A 30 foot bus would have a seating capacity of 25. Metro would like to use those small buses. They've signified their intent to purchase those smaller buses for those kinds of routes, but as I have told you, they replaced zero buses last year. They can't replace them with 30 buses with the current funding stream. They've talked about even using large sized passenger vans for some of the outer routes. They'll be "right sizing" the vehicles when they can do so.

President Vanover: What the, and I'm not sure the length of it, but I call them the "accordion buses", where are they fitting in? Are they just strictly on express routes?

Mr. Hardy: Those buses are used on the 78 route and you see them quite often and they are also used on the 3x, which is a Montgomery Express bus. It's kind of like "BRT Lite". It does not stop that often, but it's extremely packed at all times. It's a very nice route. I've taken it out to Kenwood. It's like a 25 minute ride from downtown. I work downtown, so it's great. To answer your question, they're used on both of those routes at this time. We hope that, and they got those buses from federal grants. We're hoping with more investment, we can see more of those routes on some of our higher demand lines. Particularly one that I use very often in 19; it could use an accordion route or two on it.

President Vanover: Well, I used to, many years ago, worked downtown and rode 23 express and probably one of the best things that they did, and I saw this morning as I was sitting in the God-forsaken traffic on 71, clear the shoulders and allow the buses to run because, realistically, when I was riding, and that was one of the summers of the orange barrels on 75, there was no gain other than I wasn't driving and I wasn't spending gas. It took me just as long in traffic as anybody else. As you were saying early on, time is a big driver. That was at least a smart move to utilize something that's already in place now. It sounds good. I commend you guys, as Mr. Hawkins did, for doing your homework and I agree. It's huge. We see the Butler County (BRTA), tying in at Tri County. They come

City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

President Vanover (continued): across Chester Road there too. We know there's both a workforce market and a job market out there. I commend you and I whole-heartedly see the need and the support. Obviously we did a resolution earlier on that. Keep us in the loop and let us know what can be done and we'll be more than happy to assist because we've benefit not only our employers, but also our residents too because they can be employees someplace other than home. Thank you.

Mr. Samaan: If I just may throw in one last thing. In terms of the buses running on the shoulders of the interstates. That's something we'd like to see as well. It's something that OKI has done studies on, has planned for, but has not done because of the funding. We envisioned sort of, doesn't have to be dedicated lanes only for transit on the interstates, it could be a high occupancy vehicle lane. Three people in a car can use it. In places like L.A., they charge for those lanes, but here it would be probably free to encourage people to carpool. Those could be installed already on 71 and in terms of 75, it would be a matter of re-striping, maybe using the shoulders in certain areas where there wouldn't be enough room. Another part of that puzzle would be the ramps leading into downtown and the uptown areas where with funding, we can get matching grants from the federal government, even from the State of Ohio to dedicate space on those ramps so that when the buses get to downtown, they can just zoom in; bypass the rest of traffic. Because it's a big perception. If you are sitting in traffic on 75 and you're not moving, and buses are just going by, you're going to say, "Why am I sitting here?" It's a big perception boost to people. So yes, 71 has been using that and we'd like to see those on most if not all of the interstates in the high traffic areas.

Mr. Hardy: I'd also add to that. I had a conversation with Todd Portune the other day about this. He expressed great support for it as well as far as he was saying that one lane on 75 could be dedicated to some kind of smart transit where you're charging the whole way up 75 if you're using this particular lane if you have a particular vehicle and stuff like that and it could be used for transportation as well. I am very pleased to know that we are, as a County, we are being forward thinking because sometimes we get stuck, but it seems that we're moving in the right direction as far as our thoughts and we just need movement now.

President Vanover: Thank you.

Mr. Hardy: No problem.

Committee and Official Reports

Civil Service Commission:

Mr. Coleman: Civil Service did meet on January 4<sup>th</sup> and prior to the meeting, Mrs. Kathy Nienaber was there to be sworn in by Mrs. Kathy McNear in order to make sure that we have the appropriate number of individuals on Civil Service. So, again, that in fact, took place for the purpose of the officers. The Commission also made the decision that the members, the current members, would retain their current officer positions so there wouldn't be any change in who was the Chairman, or the Vice-Chairman or the Secretary. Everybody was in agreement that it was working well. If it works well, no need to try and fix it. Also, Mrs. Zimmerlin requested permission from the Commission to begin the process for the following positions: Firefighter, Police Sergeant, and Police Department Administrative Supervisor. Having heard that, the Commission did provide the approval to begin that process for the positions. What we learned is that the testing agency had indicated that they would like to do two of those tests on the same day which is a good idea since they're already here, why not go ahead and take care of two of those positions on the same day, therefore we wouldn't have to reserve space on two different dates. We could do it on one day and get everything squared away and taken care of. So, again we're waiting on the finalization of those details. The testing company has said that they're pretty sure that that can be accommodated so we'll again, wait for the final date and time in order to move that process forward. That concludes my report.

Rules and Laws	Mrs. Emerson	-	No report
Finance Committee	Mr. Hawkins	-	No report

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

### Planning Commission

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: The Planning Commission met on January 9<sup>th</sup> in these chambers. We voted on officers. We did retain the same officers of Don Darby for Chairperson, Dave Okum for Vice-Chair, Rich Bauer for Secretary. The SCP Springdale LLC at 12110 Princeton Pike which is the former GE Park, they came. There was no action being taken because they didn't have their plans turned in on time, but we did have the continuation of the Public Hearing from the previous meeting and they had met with the people from The Crossings and they were coming up with new plans and things like that and they were still kind of figuring out what would be best for everybody. In order for them to have time to turn in their new plans and be heard, we tabled them to the March meeting which is when they are going to come and they're going to have the continued public hearing and they will have all their plans and everything by then. We also heard from the Housing Network of Hamilton County at 242 West Sharon Road. They were asking for a major change to the preliminary transition district and development plan and both Lawrence Hawkins and myself felt that this was a major change and they were wanting to build four one-story housing units for special needs and handicapped people to live in and that was a public hearing. It was voted 6-1 affirmative. The TH Springdale Ohio 1UTLC at 11530 Princeton Pike, the former Longhorn Steak House in Cassinelli Square came for a major change to the preliminary PUD district development plan. They want to build a hospital. It's a very small hospital with an eight bed ER and then a smaller in-patient on the other side, six beds and that also passed with a 6-1 vote. Again, Mr. Hawkins and myself both felt that this was a major change. The Vineyard Ministries LLC at 11345 Century Circle West came with a map amendment to planned unit development district preliminary development plan. They want to do some medical things there as well to expand the services that they offer. That was a public hearing and it was passed with a 7-0 vote. Devin Nager at 325 Pictoria Drive, the former Bahama Breeze, came for a major change to preliminary PUD district development plan. Both Mr. Hawkins and myself felt that it was a major change. They want to knock down the Bahama Breeze and build an extended stay hotel. The extended stay hotel is a Hilton brand. So it's going to be a more upscale extended stay. That was passed by a 7-0 vote. If Lawrence has anything to add or if you have any questions.

### Board of Zoning Appeals

Mrs. Ghantous: Board of Zoning Appeals met yesterday evening, however we did not have any applications. We just did the swearing in of the new folks. We welcomed back Bob Weidlich and there also was a swearing in of Jeff Anderson and Greg Johnson. We voted on officers and the officers remained the same. We've got Joe Ramirez as our Chairman, Dave Nienaber as our Vice-Chairman, Carmen Daniels as the Secretary. It was very short and sweet and that completes my report.

Mayor Webster: I had a question for Meghan. On the housing on Sharon Road, Sort of getting a mixed read on that. Now this is four single family houses? One person per unit? Or is it multi units?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: It is a multi-unit. It's four single units. So, it's a multi-unit in the fact that there's four, it's on one spot, but they are one apartment. There's four one apartment buildings. One bedroom.

Mayor Webster: So each one of the four buildings will house one person.

Mrs. Ghantous: Are they attached or detached?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: They did not have plans that specified exactly right now. They were just getting the change to the PUD and they were going to come with their specific plans once that they had the funding and everything that was in order.

Mayor Webster: Okay, that's what I've been trying to get my arms around. How many people are we talking about? It sounds like we're talking about four people.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: Four.

Mayor Webster: Thank you.

City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Hawkins: The little drawing they had the four units touching and it had a circle in the middle and then parking sort of off to the side off of the circle. So I don't recall them specifying how many people were going to be in there, but it appeared that it was going to be individual units based on the size of the apartments.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: They called it the multi-unit the four unit single household so it made it sound like it was one in each.

Board of Health

Mrs. Emerson: The Board of Health met on January 11, 2018. The Health Commissioner's report; the Willows Work Group met on January 9<sup>th</sup>. They continue to work on the plans for the Spring Sports Camp at Heritage Hill. Heritage Hill and Springdale Elementary plan to be the participants in that. The Public Health Accreditation Board (PHAB), Springdale Health Department received \$17,400 of the Ohio Department of Health grant for this accreditation. They applied for a \$17,000 grant under the Project Dawn at the Ohio Department of Health also, so that's to come. I'll let you know how that comes out. Springdale Health Department hosted a quarterly PHAB accreditation meeting for Southwest Ohio in December. Wally Burton from the Ohio Department of Health attended and he advised of an upcoming \$5,000 grant opportunity for the Springdale Health Department. We applied for that also. We're going to have two student interns to help in the Health Department. One is going to be a student from Wright State University and the other student will be from Western Kentucky University. Springdale Hotel Motel or SNAP program has a meeting on February 2<sup>nd</sup>. There's going to be a representative from the Ohio Fire Marshall's and Springdale Health Department will continue to work with these organizations and numerous Springdale city departments in the effort to provide the hotel motel operators in Springdale with the tools needed to attain continuous quality improvement within their organizations. The Nurses Report, the influenza information from CDC flu view as of December 27<sup>th</sup> shows that the influenza activity is widespread. The most frequently reported virus is the Influenza A. The number of cases in Ohio has reached the peak number of cases and there are more hospitalized already than in the five year average. Most of those are 65 years of age and older. Advice from the CDC continues to tell you to call your healthcare provider to obtain an anti-viral medication which is like Tamiflu when you first experience the symptoms of influenza. The symptoms include fever, severe headaches, pains, fatigue, respiratory issues and/or cough with sudden onsets. The Latino Coalition of Southwest Ohio continues to meet monthly on the first Thursday morning of the month. There are plans underway for the Latino Expo in the fall and for participation in the Heritage Hill Sports Camp. The mammogram van will be here April 6<sup>th</sup> from 1:30-3:30 at the Community Center. They usually visit Springdale twice a year. The Children's Health Fair is scheduled for May 18, 2018 at the Springdale Community Center and they had their meeting January 24<sup>th</sup>. The next Board of Health meeting will be February 8<sup>th</sup> at 7:00 p.m. That concludes my report.

Capital Improvements                      Mrs. Emerson                      -                      No report

O-K-I    Mr. Shroyer                      -                      No report

Mayor's Report

Mayor Webster: Mrs. Ghantous stole my thunder. I was going to announce that Bob Weidlich was being appointed to the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mrs. Ghantous: Sorry about that.

Mayor Webster: I think I communicated that to all of you by written communique earlier in the month, but just for the Council records, Mr. Weidlich has rejoined the board. He was a 16 year member of the board and he's been off for the last two years and he's ready to go back to work. We took advantage of his generosity. We're glad to have Bob back with us. Just to give you a final report on S.O.S. We had our wrap-up meeting today. Our Christmas program, I think I shared this with you at the last meeting, this year we helped 80 families, about 205 children. I think the amazing thing that served us today was when our Treasurer gave the report of how much we spent and how much we received for donations. This year we spent \$5,628 to service those families. Donations were \$5,632. So we brought in four dollars more than what we spent and I think that's just absolutely incredible that this community

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mayor Webster (continued): opened up their hearts and their pocketbooks to help this endeavor. So, thank all of you very very much. So now that, bear in mind, that is just how much money that was donated to S.O.S. In addition to that, all the food that we provided the people and all the gifts that were given by the donor families. So, it was really another huge success and we are looking forward to starting a new fundraiser this year. We'll share the details of that with you as we go along. We're going to have a Euchre Tournament down at the Community Center somewhere around mid-October on a Saturday evening and we hope to raise some money for our endeavors. That concludes my report.

Clerk of Council/Finance Director

Mrs. McNear: The General Fund Year to Date receipts through December 31<sup>st</sup>. Based on net receipts of \$17.183 million dollars. We actually received \$18.526 million dollars which is 108% of the anticipated budget. Always like to see that number in the plus 100 range. The Major General Fund Receipt Sources are Earnings Tax, Real Estate Taxes, Paramedic Services, Local Government Funds, and Mayor's Court. That is \$17.236 million dollars or 93% of that budget. Just to point out to our Earnings Tax is 15.353 million dollars of that \$17.236 million dollars. For the expenditures based on the net expenditures \$18.374 million dollars. We actually spent \$17.589 million dollars or 99% of the budget. We ended up the year for our General Fund at \$3.014 million dollars. That concludes my report. Thank you.

Administrator's Report

Mr. Parham: Council, just a couple of quick items. Our Police Department has been contacted by the cities of Montgomery and Forest Park who have requested the ability to use the City's jail to house prisoners. Each community estimates that they will have anywhere from between one or two prisoners a month. Presently, the City contracts with the City of Blue Ash, Village of Glendale, Village of Greenhills and the City of Sharonville. They all pay us \$70 per day for when one of their prisoners are in our facility. We have currently two female jails and we have four male jails. In talking to the Police Chief, he believes that we can very easily accommodate these two organizations. I know during the budget process, there were questions raised relative to whether or not that it's a good idea to continue to have our jail and what the costs were. As we look at our 2016 costs, the actual expenditures were \$8,555, which averages out to about \$23 a day. That isn't only for prisoners from other jurisdictions, but it's primarily our prisoners. In 2016 we brought in \$4,340 with the prisoner upkeep program. We're estimating 2018 revenues of \$2,500 with expenditures of \$10,000. The expenditure in the budget amount will average about \$28 a day. This past year we budgeted \$10,000 and our estimate was somewhere around \$7,500. So we think that, again, the program is clearly, I believe paying for itself. It doesn't put an amount of undo pressure on us. There is a question about whether or not we think we should still have the jail. I think one of the things that the Chief pointed out to me as I had a discussion with him this evening, the types of individuals that we may typically have received from another jurisdiction and sometimes our own, are individuals who may have received a DUI and they have to serve those three days. They serve those three days in our facility so that they can begin working towards getting their license back. The other instances are individuals who are repeated no-shows for one of the communities Mayor's Court. One of the advantages of having a jail is that when you don't have a jail, and individuals simply know that there probably isn't any recourse if they don't show up for Mayor's Court or if they don't show up or they don't pay a fine. But, when you have a jail as we do, there is then the threat that you will have to do time if you do not show up for court. I think as the Chief and I have talked, there's a great benefit to our community of being one of the only that has holding facilities. If Council is in concurrence, we would like to bring legislation for entering into agreements with the cities of Montgomery and Forest Park perhaps at the next meeting. Glendale, Greenhills, and Sharonville were all contracts that we had prior to 2011 and in 2011, we added Blue Ash to that process. Other items to point out, if an individual has health issues; things such as they may need to take insulin because they're a diabetic or whether an individual is pregnant or whether someone is going through drug withdrawals, we do not accept their prisoners. There are times that, and I think that it happened to us just yesterday or it was today, where an individual we may arrest and they may have indicated that they have some sort of condition we'll have our life squad come over, check them out and then we'll offer the opportunity to transport them to the local hospital. If they're our prisoner, we give them a date on when they are to report back. If it's one of the other jurisdictions, we simply contact them and let them know we have released their prisoner to one of the local hospitals. With that, I'll answer any questions if you have any.

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mayor Webster: Derrick threw around a lot of numbers there, but bottom line is that we get \$70 a day and we spend about \$20 to \$25. We're making a few bucks.

President Vanover: Council, do you support bringing legislation in to add the other two communities? (Council agreed by a show of hands).

Mr. Parham: Okay. We'll work on that.

President Vanover: Alright.

Mr. Parham: Second item, just as an update for you. I've reported a couple of times on the Community Development Block Grant Program. We were notified that on January 10<sup>th</sup> the County Commissioners adopted the Action Plan. The Action Plan has now been adopted by the County and is, at this point, awaiting a budget to be passed by Congress. If that happens, then the funding that has been approved for Springdale is \$15,000 each year over the three years of 2018, 2019, and 2020 for the Home Improvement Program, and then an additional \$40,000 in year three, or 2020 for playground equipment. We're simply hoping that something happens in Washington so that we can receive those funds. The last item that I have is just to touch on each of the presentations that were presented by Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup for the major modifications and also the amendment to the Zoning Code/Zoning Map. We will need to have and schedule public hearings for each of those. We will suggest that the first reading for each of those would be at the February 7<sup>th</sup> meeting and then the public hearing and the second reading would be at the February 21<sup>st</sup> meeting. If you're inclined, we can schedule those and complete the advertising. That's all I have for you. Thank you.

### Law Director's Report

Mr. Forbes: Just a couple of brief items tonight. I understand at the last council meeting there was a question that came up about the oath of office that officials take. We've had a chance to confirm what we believed was the answer even that night. It's set forth both in the Charter and in your Codified Ordinances the requirement that there be an oath of office, there is no requirement that it be done in writing or that anything is signed. We can continue doing things the way we have. So we confirmed that. The only other item I wanted to give you an update on the state litigation that the City is a party to regarding the centralized collection of the municipal income tax. That case right now is in the process of being briefed. The group of municipalities, the attorneys for you filed their brief, I believe it was last week. The State of Ohio has to file their response brief in early February and then the municipalities will have a chance to file a reply brief. That case is schedule for an injunction hearing in front of the judge. They've blocked out February 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup> to have the actual hearing in front of the judge. The judge is aware that there are some deadlines set out in that new state law, so we anticipate that there should be some decision rather quickly after that February hearing date. The reason that I bring it up is because depending on what happens at that hearing, the court could grant an injunction, which, in essence, throws out the State law. Or, they could not and if they do not, one of the requirements of that state law is that we make some amendments to our income tax ordinance. We have to kind of wait and see what happens at this February hearing, but there's a possibility that, at your second meeting in February, and we'll have time to discuss this more, but there may be a need to have some legislation at your February meeting. We have to wait and see what happens at this hearing. I happened to read the brief that was filed and, as I've said all along, they make a number of, what I believe, are very compelling arguments in favor of the municipalities. That would conclude my report.

### Engineer's Report

Mr. Shvegza: On the Beacon Hills/Kenn Road Project, basically the bids were open November 21<sup>st</sup> and the contract was awarded to Prus Construction at the December 20<sup>th</sup> council meeting. We have pre-construction meeting that's actually scheduled for January 30<sup>th</sup> so we'll get an idea of what the schedule is on that. Right now we are anticipating that it will start sometime early March and be completed in the fall of this year. As far as the Jake Sweeney Place Reconstruction Project, the bid opening for this project took place December 20<sup>th</sup>. Legislation to award the contract to Barrett Paving Materials in the amount of \$900,779.82 is before Council at tonight's meeting. Glensprings Drive repair and resurfacing; we've switched the schedule on this. We actually substituted this for where the Cloverdale project was going to go. The revised schedule now is actually out for advertisement yesterday. Bid openings January 30<sup>th</sup> report to Council on February 7<sup>th</sup> with legislation to

City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Shvegza (continued): award the contract on February 21<sup>st</sup>. Cloverdale Area Resurfacing Project, we had some additional work. There was a determination after review of some of the storm sewers that there had to be some replacement of the storm sewers on Smiley and Cloverdale so that had to be designed to add to the project. In addition, the repair resurfacing work on the municipal main building parking lot will be added as an alternate bid. The design for that was done and put out probably four years ago now. It's just really updating the plans and including them with this to get an alternate bid to see where we are on that. In regards to the water main project as far as the project that's most significantly under construction right now on the west side, they expect that to be completed by sometime in March. As far as the actual construction for the Cloverdale project itself, the resurfacing project, we're looking at advertising February 1<sup>st</sup>, opening bids February 15<sup>th</sup>, report to Council February 21<sup>st</sup> and legislation to award the contract at the March 7<sup>th</sup> Council meeting. Regarding the Police Department roof replacement, this work has been completed. Inspection of the work has taken place and a punch list has been prepared and submitted to the contractor to address issues. West Kemper Road resurfacing which is from basically from Northland Boulevard to Jake Sweeney Place, the schedule is currently under design. Advertisement for bids March 6<sup>th</sup>, open bids March 20<sup>th</sup>, report to Council on March 21<sup>st</sup>, legislation to award contract on April 4<sup>th</sup> and anticipated construction to start early May with completion in late June. That concludes my report.

Communications Mrs. McNear - None

Communications from the Audience - None

Ordinances and Resolutions

ORDINANCE NO. 3-2018

AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CLERK OF COUNCIL/FINANCE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH BARRETT PAVING MATERIALS FOR THE JAKE SWEENEY PLACE REHABILITATION PROJECT AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup made a motion to adopt; Mrs. Emerson seconded.

Ordinance No. 3-2018 passes with seven affirmative votes.

ORDINANCE NO. 4-2018

AMENDING SECTION 30.01 OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF SPRINGDALE REGARDING COUNCIL OFFICERS AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY

Mrs. Ghantous made a motion to adopt; Mrs. Emerson seconded.

Mayor Webster: Have a question for Mr. Forbes. The only four changes on here is the fact that we are eliminating "the election shall be by secret ballot". Is that true? (Mr. Forbes nods in agreement). Okay, so the new language is silent on that. So, my concern is that 10-15 years from now, somebody looks at this and says, "I'd like to do the secret ballot. It doesn't say we can't." So I wonder if we should maybe take it a step further and not just eliminate the secret ballot, but also be proactive and say, "It shall NOT be by secret ballot or shall be open ballot" or whatever language you want to use. I am concerned about just leaving it non-committal.

Mr. Forbes: That's certainly possible to add whatever language to do that.

Mr. Anderson: I share the concern about it being silent and I also have another concern that I wanted to raise. I do agree that the secret ballot language needs to be removed. My other concern with this is that it's being raised as an emergency ordinance. In the pending legislation report, it was described as it was going to be a hearing and a second hearing, although I understand on the agenda, that this is reflected correctly. I'm wondering if there could be some more discussion on what the reason that this would need to be done as an emergency ordinance instead of having the normal procedure with multiple hearings.

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

President Vanover: Well, we'll address this. Mr. Parham did you want to talk on this or something else?

Mr. Parham: No. I can do either unless the Law Director wishes to address it.

President Vanover: Go ahead Mr. Parham.

Mr. Parham: So, as we identified in the Pending Legislation Report, there will be, or, there is scheduled to be two readings. The first reading scheduled for this evening. The next or second reading is scheduled for the next Council meeting, and if Council so chooses at that point, they can leave the emergency clause on after the second reading so that it can go into effect immediately. Again, that's Council's option and opportunity as to which you choose to do. Whether you choose to have it go into effect immediately or you choose for it to go into effect 30 days after the passage. The only other comment that I had was that we provided you with a clean copy of the document and we also provided you with a markup copy. I didn't want anyone to think that the markup is really the exhibit. It is just for information purposes.

Mayor Webster: I think is one of those ordinances that the sooner we get this changed, the better off it's going to be. Especially since we've got a pending court date and I would like to Mr. Forbes be able to report to the judge that we've changed that ordinance already. It's already in effect. I think every hour we leave that on the books, we're in violation of it. I think we need to get that off and we need to get it off quickly. I'm not quarrelling with you wanting to discuss it more, but I think we all know why it's on there and why we're doing it and so let's talk about it and let's get it off.

Mr. Anderson: I appreciate that. That was the commentary I was looking for. Is it a reaction? Those changes that came from the State came some time ago. I understand timing matters. So, I'm fine with that. The ordinance the way it's written and described, it didn't outline the reason that it would need to be done so quickly. I was just looking for some of that commentary. Thank you.

Mayor Webster: Did my explanation, do you think that everybody knows why we are doing it?

Mr. Anderson: Yes, that helps I believe.

Mayor Webster: I can be more direct. We have a pending lawsuit that says that we shouldn't be doing this and so we want to get it off the books.

Mr. Anderson: My concern is we're not expecting to do another one of these elections for a year and a half that would fall under the part of the ordinance that is being changed. It's not part of our normal course of business. It's just when we elect the officers, which has already been done this year. So, unless there was a change in officers, we wouldn't be doing that again for some time. I understand the need if it helps us in other matters, that makes sense.

Mayor Webster: So you're assuring us that these two gentlemen are going to be with us.

Mr. Anderson: I believe if we had to do an election, inside of chambers, then we could do an emergency ordinance and take care of it. In that case, it would be an emergency because to do a secret ballot would be a violation. So that's what I'm trying to get out of this. It's not an emergency if we don't have to do it yet.

Mr. Forbes: I'm just going to reiterate what Mr. Parham said. This was originally scheduled for first reading tonight and then consideration for adoption at your next meeting. Even with, and you can do it just like that even with the emergency clause as it is here so that if that's the path you take, upon adoption, it will go into effect immediately. Again, that's at Council's discretion whether you want to do that or not. What I will say, and I think the Mayor makes a good point, but I will tell you this. At whatever court appearance we have, whether this has been adopted or whether it has gone into effect or whether it's just been introduced, I will articulate that to the court. At the very least, I will be able to say, "They have already

City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mr. Forbes (continued): introduced legislation to remove this". I think the primary question at this point is if you want to make any amendment to clarify that language.

Mr. Shroyer: Would it be possible to ask that you clarify that language before the next meeting and at that point we'd adopt it with an emergency clause and that way we'd have a clean ordinance with the language that we're looking for?

Mr. Forbes: If that's Council's wish, then yes, we can clarify that language prior to the second reading. You can adopt it as amended then. Again, it is your ordinance so you can decide how you want to proceed with it.

Mr. Hawkins: I would be in favor of just adding at the end that there are to be no elections by secret ballot. The rest of the language is fine as far as I'm concerned.

President Vanover: Council are you in agreement/concurrence on that?

Mrs. Emerson: I agree with Mr. Hawkins.

President Vanover: Alright then. I guess the next issue is do you want to treat it to two readings?

Mr. Hawkins: I appreciate the urgency of the situation. I do think it would be appropriate to have the exhibit corrected and then come back next meeting with the emergency clause and at that point in time, I'd be fine with it being voted on and moving forward and putting it into action at that point.

President Vanover: Well, if that is Council's wishes, then we need to have the motion and the second rescinded. Mrs. Ghantous made the motion and Mrs. Emerson seconded.

Mrs. Ghantous: I rescind the motion on this ordinance until the second reading.

Mrs. Emerson: Me also.

President Vanover: Then, we'll let the corrections get made and we'll have a second reading at our next meeting.

Old Business - None

New Business - None

Meetings and Announcements

Mr. Shroyer: If I could just take a minute. My son and daughter in law had occasion to use our EMS service last week. I believe there's probably some folks over there that would say that I probably hold a pretty high standard for excellent service or for the service that they provide. Their response and service was everything that I would expect for excellent service and in fact, a couple of individuals, Mark Pelfrey and Joe Parks both went above and beyond even my expectation of excellent service and that's saying something. I just wanted to commend them and thank them for the service that they provided. Not that I would have expected anything less, but it was everything that we would expect and more. Thank you.

Mrs. Zimmerlin: Civil Service will meet in the Administrative Conference Room on Thursday, February 1<sup>st</sup> at 6:00 p.m. The Springdale Youth Sports registration is currently going on. It's for baseball, t-ball, girls softball and spring soccer. Club Rec Winter Extreme Games will take place on Friday, February 2<sup>nd</sup>. It's open to members and their guests fifth through eighth grade and you can contact the Community Center for those details. AARP is still providing income tax help. Those meetings are on Friday mornings, beginning January 26<sup>th</sup> and run through April 6<sup>th</sup>. They're one hour appointments and they're available for simple state tax returns but you do have to have an appointment for that. Finally, the Teen Fit program is for youth ages 13 to 17. It is offered on Saturday, February 11<sup>th</sup> from 1:30 p.m. to 4:30 p.m. and they will learn how to use the gym equipment appropriately and

## City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Mrs. Zimmerlin (continued): nutrition and after they do that, they will no longer need a parent to go into the Fitness Center with them.

Mr. Hawkins: Planning Commission will meet on February 13<sup>th</sup> at 7:00 p.m. in these chambers.

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: I just wanted to thank everybody who came out to the pep rally that we had for Springdale Youth Boosters for our youth sports. We had a really great turnout and I was very happy to see the elected officials come that did come and for being a snowy, freezing night, I was very very excited to see all our young athletes come with the coaches and we had Mr. Crawley, who is the Athletic Director at the high school. He came out and talked to the kids and passed out discount tickets for them to go to a Princeton game which I thought was pretty cool. We had some of the high school cheerleaders come out as well and all in all it was a really really great pep rally and again, I want to thank everyone who came out. It was a great night. Thanks.

Mayor Webster: Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup, do you want to give an announcement about the Cinema Races?

Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup: They're being held on the last Friday of February. I think it's the 24<sup>th</sup>. Yes, the 24<sup>th</sup>. The first race begins at 8:00. The doors are open at 7:00. You can buy your advance tickets at the community center for \$8. They're also for sale at the door. You must be 21 or over to enter. Please bring your ID. You will not be allowed in without one. We're cracking down. We don't care if you are the Mayor of Springdale, we will ID you. It is a fun time and we have a really cool thing this year where you can sponsor a race. I think we have four races left. It's \$50 for a race. You sponsor the race, you get to name your horses and they'll announce it. I'm sponsoring a race, so when my race comes up, it will say, "Meghan Sullivan-Wisecup's sponsored race. I have cartoon characters as all of my horses names and so you can do a theme or you can do whatever you want to do. It's a way to help raise money for youth sports. All the money goes towards them so it will help keep our sports affordable for all the young athletes of Springdale. Please come out. We'll appreciate it.

### Communications from the Audience

Mr. Samaan: I just wanted to thank you all for having us up here today and just to tell you all that there was infinitely less grandstanding here than in City Council chambers in Cincinnati. (Laughter) Thank you.

### Update on legislation still in development

Mr. Hawkins: As you review your Internal Memorandum, Item Number One was addressed with Ordinance No. 3-2018; an ordinance accepting the bid and authorizing an agreement with Barrett Paving Materials for the Jake Sweeney Place Rehabilitation Project and declaring an emergency. That passed with a 7-0 vote. We had Item Number Two which was addressed with Ordinance No. 4-2018; an ordinance amending Chapter 30 of the Springdale Codified Ordinances regarding Council's rules of procedure. We had a first reading and that matter is going to be amended and brought back at the next meeting. We also had the presentation from the Better Bus Plan by the Better Bus Coalition. All other matters were forthcoming.

City of Springdale Council

January 17, 2018

Recap of legislative items requested for next Council meeting

Mr. Hawkins: An ordinance amending Chapter 30 of the Springdale Codified Ordinances regarding Council's rules of procedure. An ordinance amending the Zoning Map for the property at 11905 Kenn Road changing the Zoning District from Residential Single Household-Low Density (RSH-L) to Public Facilities (PF) (Calvary Pentecostal Church) as well as an ordinance for the City of Montgomery and Forest Park to use our jail as well as several ordinances with regard to first readings for various major modifications to PUDs.

Adjournment

Mr. Hawkins moved to adjourn. Mrs. Sullivan-Wisecup seconded the motion and council adjourned at 8:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Kathy McNear  
Clerk of Council/Finance Director

Minutes Approved:  
Tom Vanover, President of Council

\_\_\_\_\_, 2018